

Promotional Mechanism of Position in Competence Approaches

Muhammad Nur Yamin^a, Muhammad Guntur^b, Herlina Sakawati^c, Henni Zainal^d, Yusriadi Yusriadi^e, ^{a,b,c}Universitas Negeri Makassar, Makassar, Indonesia, ^dUniversitas Indonesia Timur, Makassar, Indonesia, ^eSekolah Tinggi Ilmu Administrasi Puangrimaggalatung, Makassar, Indonesia,

Job promotion is done to support the achievement of organisational goals; someone promoted to occupy a position must be considered the right person for the job. The study aims to determine the pattern of promotion of positions in the Regional Government of Makassar City, with indicators of competence status. The research method is qualitative, using case study research that is descriptive, collected primary data from officials' and community responses to competencies in job promotion. Data is in the form of semi-structured interviews, group discussion forums, and observations in the regional secretariat unit. The validity of the data is based on the degree of trust, including peer and member checks. Data analysis techniques are the Spradley model with domain analysis, taxonomic analysis, componential analysis, and theme analysis. The results show that promotion in Makassar City begins with an inventory of vacant positions in the agency. The conditions of the position are evaluated after an inventory is held, then civil servants are sought who meet the requirements to occupy the position. The implementation of the promotion of civil servants in Makassar City has run well in terms of indicators of experience, education, and performance. These become an indicator of every implementation of a promotion. There is a problem with indications of political interests from the ruling party, yet the author did not find any such evidence, so the implementation of the promotion of civil servants in Makassar City has fulfilled the specified procedures.

Key words: *Bureaucracy, Competence, Promotion, Politics, Indonesia.*

Introduction

Human resources are the main mechanism in an organisation; human resource problems are the main issue faced by developing countries. Indonesia, as a developing country, also faces challenges in developing its human resources for national development (Qomariyah et al., 2018). Indonesia understands the strategic steps needed to improve government performance through human resources so that bureaucracy professionalism is needed. Subsequently, there has been a perception in society that bureaucracy is insensitive, public services hampered, rigid regulations, no transparency, and no accountability in government policy.

The ability of a bureaucracy to carry out its work responsibilities, is measured from the level of education and skills of its human resources. Therefore promotion as one indicator of performance is a significant aspect of employee career development (Berman, 2019). The bureaucracy needs promotion because this will have an impact on salaries, career development, and higher positions, which affects the performance of employees, responsibilities, and organisational progress. Promotion should be objective, but in reality, the promotion of office is often influenced by the politics of regional leaders (Weber, 2009).

Law Number 43 the Year 1999 concerning Personnel Principle that the task is carried out with the principle of professionalism, namely competence so that the competency indicator is from the knowledge, skills, attitudes, and behaviour of the bureaucracy. The promotion of employees is identical to the prerogative of the regional head. As a result, the Office of Advisor Agency in local government is not optimal; the interests of the political elite also contribute to determining the position of the employee. Sometimes the head of the region or the political elite intervenes in the Office of Advisory Agency in carrying out its duties. As a result, the promotion through structural positions that are expected to be able to develop employee careers and provide reliable human resources for public service services cannot be fulfilled (Yahya & Mutiarin, 2015).

The role of the Position Advisory Board in the career development of civil servants is only used as a formality. The Civil Service Authority Officer, who is held by the regional head, will determine the career of a public servant without asking for consideration from the Office of Advisory Position. These problems are common in Indonesia. The role of the Advisory Board Position faces many challenges in the organisational and political environment. Making the Position Advisory Board unable to carry out its duties and functions as developing civil servant performance, so that it cannot ascertain the process of promotion of public service, whether it is following standard operating procedures or not.

Other research, related to the mechanism of filling Kotamobagu City government positions through the promotion of the job begins with forming a selection committee. The selection

committee carries out the selection with the assistance of an independent competency assessment team. After the selection committee is established, they coordinate with the state civil apparatus commission. Procedures for implementation start with the announcement of the selection of filling government positions along with the stages of implementation and registration requirements. Then the administrative documents of participant registration are selected, and the results announced for competency selection and candidate interviews (Mokodongan et al., 2019).

Other research shows the implementation of promotion in the Palu City Regional Secretariat begins with an inventory of vacant positions and an evaluation of the conditions of the job. Subsequently a list is held and then a Civil Servant is sought a who is qualified to hold the position. After that, employees who meet the requirements submitted at least three people to be discussed and determined one of them as a material consideration to the Mayor. Then the review was approved by the Mayor and stipulated in the Mayor's decision is to then hold an inauguration. Sometimes the employee's discipline that is promoted does not match the vacant position. Similarly, in the case of promotion based on performance appraisal, there are still employees who have low grades but are included in the development of employee positions. The implementation of employee promotions does not always follow established procedures (Rustuti, 2015).

This study seeks to identify the phenomenon that occurs in the Makassar City government when the implementation of promotion is not based on the principles of professionalism and objective conditions. Furthermore when the promotion is determined by political interests and not based on the competency of the employee, the implementation of bureaucracy does not run effectively and efficiently. It is interesting to study the promotion of positions carried out in the Government of Makassar City through different perspectives. Namely, the role of the Office of Position and Rank as an organisation that aims to give consideration and input according to the position and principal tasks and functions, according to Makassar Mayor Regulation Number 17 of 2013, concerning the Agency Position and Rank Considerations. It is something that is elaborated in-depth in this study, along with factors that influence the promotion of the position of the Government of Makassar City.

Literature Review

Human Resources

Human resources are generally interpreted to be more potent than before, both in terms of authority, responsibility, and the individual abilities they possess (Sawitri et al., 2019). Human resources are understood as power sourced from humans, which can also be called power or strength inherent in humans themselves in the sense that can be demonstrated in terms of energy, power, ability, namely knowledge, skills, and attitudes. From this understanding, it

can be concluded that human resources are an effort to empower further the power possessed by humans themselves in the form of competence, authority, and responsibility to improve organisational performance (Hasbi et al., 2019).

Definition of Performance

Performance is a condition of the ability of employees to carry out tasks under standard operating procedures in an organisation (Yusriadi et al., 2019). Bureaucracy views employee performance strategically, which means they assist the organisation in achieving its vision and mission. Each employee is required to work efficiently, with discipline, quality, and dedication so that the organisation can provide maximum service to the community (Umar, Farida, et al., 2019). Employees can learn to employ information by referring to a formal and structured system to measure, assess, and influence the nature of work.

Performance-based management is one part of public sector reform also known as the new general manager. The focus of performance-based management is the measurement of the performance of public sector organisations that are oriented towards outcome measurement. The performance-based approach is characterised by the emergence of organisational and management theories such as classical organisation theory models, scientific management, zero-based budgeting, management by objectives, and reinventing government. Organisations are required to create performance-based accountability systems as a means to provide performance information to the public and other stakeholders (Mustafa et al., 2019).

Job Promotion

Job promotion is a mechanism to increase ability and responsibility to impact positively on performance, so that the less empowered employee may become more empowered (Awaluddin et al., 2019). For development to show better performance, it is necessary to have a model for the promotion of roles such as assigning tasks, placing, motivating leaders, connecting responsibilities, and fostering an organisational culture that is conducive to improving organisational performance. In job promotion relationships, it is also necessary to develop appropriate strategies, namely inward-looking, outward-looking, and developing partnerships. Promotion of positions is implemented in organisations through giving apparent authority, developing competencies, developing trust, utilising opportunities, delivering responsibilities, and developing organisational culture (Yusriadi et al., 2018). It is expected that human resources in the organisation provide significant, strategic, and comprehensive activities for each organisation's activities so that an employee can realise their performance as expected (Rijal et al., 2019).

Methodology

The research method is qualitative, with the type of case study research being descriptive, and oriented to understanding the contrasting patterns of the existence of competency aspects of employee promotion patterns in the Makassar City Government of South Sulawesi Province. Secondary research data is obtained from each official's track record on assignments and job evaluation results. Primary data is collected from officials' and community responses regarding political influence and attention to competencies in job promotion in the form of semi-structured interviews, group discussion forums, and observations in the regional secretariat unit. The validity of the data is based on the degree of trust, including peer and member checks. Data analysis techniques use the Spradley model with domain analysis, taxonomic analysis, componential analysis, and theme analysis.

Results and Discussion

Promotion of Civil Servants in Makassar City

Promotion is the process of moving employees from one position to another higher location. If the development is implemented for outstanding civil servants, it would motivate other public servants to improve their performance. Implementation of promotions in Makassar is carried out within the scope of the agency itself and outside the agency, meaning that the procedures used are internal and external promotions. This action is based on the consideration that a civil servant's morale can increase when entering the new level. So that knowledge about the environment and loyalty to agencies is expected to be good.

The results of the study illustrate that in Makassar each position promotion takes into account the established procedures. To carry out a promotion program for civil servants it is necessary to determine the terms of the regulation first (Peters & Pierre, 2008). If the regional leader conducts promotions to civil servants without regard to established procedures, mistakes can occur, which would be detrimental to the agency. Promotion procedures should be used in setting standards for public servants who are entitled to be promoted. Therefore, each promotion is expected to guarantee that civil servants have excellent performance compared to their previous positions.

The procedures for each position vary; there are general and technical requirements such as work persuasion, education level, and work experience. Regional leaders must provide opportunities for their subordinates to meet these requirements and avoid unfair actions so that all civil servants feel equal in their rights and obligations. Employees naturally want promotion under existing procedures. Public servants do not want the implementation of

forced positions. so that fair competition among employees is encouraged to pursue work performance rewarded (Yusriadi, 2018).

For the promotion policy to work for agencies, it is necessary to have a clear structure that uses objective indicators by looking at the careers of civil servants in carrying out their duties and fulfilling the established requirements (Umar, Amrin, et al., 2019). Based on the results of interviews conducted with informants in the city of Makassar, the procedures for implementing civil servant promotions include:

Work Experience

Work experience is often used as a condition of carrying out promotions because long working periods affect performance compared to civil servants who do not have work experience. Seniority defined the length of service of someone recognised in the organisation, both in the position concerned and in the organisation as a whole (Sarker, 2008). In seniority is also reflected someones age; besides that, the employees promoted adjusted to their qualifications and experience. Priority is one form of an organisation's appreciation to workers for their loyalty and dedication to the organisation. Therefore, this system will encourage workers to be more loyal to their institutions (Fehr et al., 2014).

The results of interviews with several informants revealed that indicators of experience should be considered because senior civil servants have more experience than junior civil servants. It is hoped that the employee would have additional performance, ideas, and excellent managerial skills so that it is considered appropriate for the position to be given. Other indicators are having knowledge capability so that it will be easy to solve a problem wisely (Johnson et al., 1994). The experience of civil servants in institutions affects the increase in knowledge, skills, and ability in the service of an institution. Thus the longer time that the person works will affect the person's performance improvement (Russell, 2014).

Level of Education

The level of education is one of the leading indicators of the implementation of promotion. The principle of the right person in the right place is fundamental to application in an agency. Because employees who are placed in a position adjusted to their educational qualifications, if the educational requirements are not suitable for the field of work it will cause problems, and would not provide development in an agency (Lam, 2005).

Education affects the work potential of civil servants; the higher the education the more that is expected in terms of transformational thinking. People with the right skills and training who are provided with motivation opportunities, will be more capable of carrying out their duties.

When faced with problems civil servants with a higher level of education will find it easier to solve, analyse, and choose the best course of action to resolve issues and be able to anticipate problems. Therefore, implementation of the promotion of civil servants must be adapted to their educational background, to facilitate the completion of their work (SusanBruce, 1999). The educational aspects of civil servants in the Makassar City government are one of the essential considerations of the position required. With support the effectiveness of the implementation of employee duties and the completion of tasks are carried out as expected.

The results of the study illustrate that there are still civil servants' promotions that do not match their skill. This is reinforced by the results of interviews with informants stating that sometimes the appointment of public servants to occupy specific jobs is not in accordance with their educational background, but only by looking at work experience. This means that at the implementation of promoting, less attention is paid to aspects of education, and more attention is inclined towards factors of personal preference (Almendares, 2011).

The results of the study show that the implementation of the promotion of civil servant policies in Makassar City, with educational indicators as a requirement in considering the application of promotions after going through several stages. However, due to the lack of personnel resources, the development of civil servants in current positions is not through their education.

Work Performance

The work performance of civil servants becomes an indicator of the promotion implementation through looking at a new position or task assigned by the agency. Determination of performance as a prerequisite for implementing promotions will motivate employees to improve their performance (Bauer & Ege, 2012). Agencies in Makassar City assume work performance of civil servants as the main criteria in the implementation of promotions. Forms of promotion are carried out with performance as a basis for policy considerations. The basis for performance is carried out in the framework of adjustments between capabilities and specific occupational standards (Weiss, 2000).

Promotion is vital in organisations as return for the work of civil servants do to compete in providing the best for the organisation, with improved performance. Thus, civil servants who have high work performance will get a significant promotion opportunity too. Through this performance appraisal, it will be known who can occupy a higher position. In the long run, it can be estimated to what extent a civil servant can reach the peak of their career. Performance appraisals identify the development of a civil servant, career advancement opportunities, and planning for organisational success (Delcour et al., 2013). It is a government regulation that is authorised to make an assessment as an official appraisal, namely the direct supervisor of



the relevant civil servant. With this provision, the appraisal official must personally know the assessed civil servant, so that the assessment is expected to be carried out objectively.

The implementation of promotion of civil servants in Makassar City has run well in terms of indicators of experience, education, and performance has become an indicator of every implementation of the promotion. The author did not find any evidence that there was a problem with political interests of the ruling party, so the implementation of the promotion of civil servants in Makassar City has fulfilled the specified procedures.

Conclusion

Promotion in Makassar City begins with an inventory of vacant positions in the agency. There is an evaluation of the conditions of a position, after an inventory is held, then civil servants are sought who meet the requirements to occupy the position. After that, public servants who meet the requirements are proposed for discussion, and one of them is determined as a material for consideration to the regional leader after the consideration has been approved, then stipulated in the decision of the local leader to be subsequently held in an inauguration. Fulfilment of promotion requirements, in general, have been carried out, this can be seen from the educational qualifications. Employee disciplines will be promoted according to vacant positions. Similarly, in terms of promotion based on performance appraisal, civil servants have fulfilled the procedures. This means that the implementation of the promotion of civil servants is in accordance with established procedures.

REFERENCES

- Almendares, N. (2011). Politicization of bureaucracy. In *SAGE International Encyclopedia of Political Science*. Sage Publications.
https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=2641351
- Awaluddin, A., Siraj, M. L., & Yusriadi. (2019). The effectiveness of the implementation of independent community empowerment programs In Bone District. *International Journal of Scientific & Technology Research*, 8(8), 352–354.
- Bauer, M. W., & Ege, J. (2012). Politicization within the European commission's bureaucracy. *International Review of Administrative Sciences*, 78(3).
<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1177%2F0020852312445022>
- Berman, D. R. (2019). *Local government and the states: Autonomy, politics, and policy*. Routledge.
- Delcour, C., Gremler, D. D., Riel, A. C. R. van, & Birgelen, M. van. (2013). Effects of perceived employee emotional competence on customer satisfaction and loyalty: The mediating role of rapport. *Journal of Service Management*, 24(1): 5-24.
<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1108/09564231311304161>
- Fehr, R., Yam, K. C., & Dang, C. (2015). Moralized leadership: The construction and consequences of ethical leader perceptions. *Academy of Management Review*, 40(2), 182-209.
<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.5465/amr.2013.0358>
- Hasbi, Sukimi, M. F., Latief, M. I., & Yusriadi, Y. (2019). Compromise in traditional ceremonies: A case study of the rambu solo' ceremony in Toraja Regency. *Humanities & Social Sciences Reviews*, 7(6). 286-291.
<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.18510/hssr.2019.7651>
- Johnson, R. N., & Libecap, G. D. (1994). Patronage to merit and control of the federal government labor force. *Explorations in Economic History*, 31(1), 91-119.
<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1006/exeh.1994.1004>
- Lam, W. (2005). Barriers to e-government integration. *Journal of Enterprise Information Management*, 18(5). 147-152.
<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1108/17410390510623981>
- Mokodongan, D., Mantiri, M., & Kumayas, N. (2019). Promosi Jabatan dalam Meningkatkan kinerja Aparatur Sipil Negara (ASN) Di Pemerintah Kota Kotamobagu. *Jurnal Eksekutif*, 3(3). 114-116. <https://ejournal.unsrat.ac.id/index.php/jurnaleksekutif/article/view/23848>



- Mustafa, D., Farida, U., & Yusriadi, Y. (2019). The effectiveness of public services through e-government in makassar City. *International Journal of Scientific & Technology Research*, 9(1). 101-110.
- Peters, B. G., & Pierre, J. (2008). *Politicians, bureaucrats and administrative reform*. Routledge.
- Qomariyah, E., Zauhar, S., Muluk, M. R. K., & Setyowati, E. (2019). Placement of regional apparatus based on merit in structural position based on system thinking approach. *JPAS (Journal of Public Administration Studies)*, 3(2), 62-68. <https://doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.21776/ub.jpas.2018.003.02.1>
- Rijal, S., Haerani, Y., Mayasari, R. E., & Yusriadi, Y. (2019). The effectiveness of implementation of government regulation number 41 the year 2011 on the development of youth entrepreneurship and pioneering and the provision of youth facilities and infrastructures in Kolaka. *International Journal of Scientific & Technology Research*, 8(10). 105-108. <http://www.ijstr.org/research-paper-publishing.php?month=oct2019>
- Russell, N. (2014). The Emergence of Milgram's Bureaucratic Machine. *Journal of Social Issues*, 70(3), 409–423. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1111/josi.12068>
- Rustuti, E. (2015). Analisis Promosi Jabatan di Sekretariat Daerah Kota Palu. *Katalogis*, 3(8). 189-193. <http://jurnal.untad.ac.id/jurnal/index.php/Katalogis/article/view/6398>
- Sarker, A. E. (2008). Patron-client politics and its implications for good governance in Bangladesh. *Intl Journal of Public Administration*, 31(12), 1416-1440. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1080/01900690802194966>
- Sawitri, N. N., Ermayanti, D., Farida, U., Junus, D., Baharuddin, Hasmin, Yusriadi, Rachman, E., Jumra, & Vikaliana, R. (2019). Human resources competency, the use of information technology and internal accounting control on time procurement of financial reporting. *1st International Conference on Advance and Scientific Innovation (ICASI)*. <https://doi.org/doi:10.1088/1742-6596/1175/1/012263>
- Bruce, C. S. (1999). Workplace experiences of information literacy. *International journal of information management*, 19(1), 33-47. [https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/S0268-4012\(98\)00045-0](https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/S0268-4012(98)00045-0)
- Umar, A., Amrin, Madani, M., Farida, U., Yusriadi, Tamsa, H., Bahtiar, Ansar, Yahya, M., Nurnaningsih, Alam, S., Gunawan, H., Darwis, Sahabuddin, C., Jamaluddin, Misbahuddin, Elpisah, Akbar, Z., Sakkir, G., ... Misnawati. (2019). One-Stop service policy as a bureaucratic reform in Indonesia. *Academy of Strategic Management Journal*,



18(2), 1–12. <https://www.abacademies.org/articles/onestop-service-policy-as-a-bureaucratic-reform-in-indonesia-8027.html>

Umar, A., Farida, U., & Yusriadi, Y. (2019). Leadership Role In Improving Responsibility Of Employee's Work In Scope Of General Bureau Of Government Of Bulukumba Regency. *International Journal of Scientific & Technology Research*, 8(10), 118-126.

Weber, M. (2009). *Terjemahan*. Pustaka Pelajar.

Weiss, T. G. (2000). Governance, good governance and global governance: conceptual and actual challenges. *Third World Quarterly*, 21(5), 795-814. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1080/713701075>

Yahya, M. R., & Mutiarin, D. (2016). Model Lelang Jabatan Di Pemerintah Daerah Daerah Istimewa Yogyakarta. *Journal of Governance and Public Policy*, 2(2), 286-329. <https://doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.18196/jgpp.2015.0035>

Yusriadi. (2018). Bureaucratic reform barriers: A case study on the one stop-integrated service office in bone regency. *Jurnal Kebijakan Dan Administrasi Publik*, 22(2), 146–154. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.22146/jkap.34536>

Sahid, A., Amirullah, I., Azis, A., & Rahman, A. A. (2019). Bureaucratic Reform to the Human Resources: A Case Study on the One-Stop Integrated Service. *The Journal of Social Sciences Research*, 4(1), 61-66. [https://arpgweb.com/pdf-files/jssr5\(1\)61-66.pdf](https://arpgweb.com/pdf-files/jssr5(1)61-66.pdf)

Yusriadi, Zulfiqar, S. B.-T., & Farida, U. (2018). Bureaucratic reform of tourism sector public services in Tana Toraja Regency. *CITIES 2018: Spatial Economic Transport Interaction for Sustainable Development*. 108-113. <https://iopscience.iop.org/article/10.1088/1755-1315/340/1/012045/meta>