

The Aesthetic Speech in Ammar's Neamah Jaber Theatrical Texts

Saif Sabah Mzaid^a, Ali Rida Hussein^{b, a,b} College of Fine Art, University of Babylon, Email: saifsabah414@gmail.com

The beauty makers derive accomplishment from accidents and events to crystallise them in aesthetic formulas that bear the character of creativity. From one artist to another, even if the subject is the same, it results in a difference in artistic content of the psychological and social effects on the creator of the art. Therefore, the subjective side effects the nature of the artistic creation in addition to the surrounding effects of the environment and climate; each artistic effect is specific to its owner and is not repeated. The nature of the Iraqi society and its composition came in accordance with the ethnic and sectarian religious affiliations, where Ibn Khaldun spoke on the introduction of accurate social analysis about the nature of the Arab society when he talked about the Bedouin and urbanisation. On the other hand, the west also studied scientifically and empirically on the ills of society and the relationship of these ills to the results of a scientific nature represented in the process of getting rid of common and prior thoughts, scientific commitment, integrity and neutrality in the study of social phenomena and the distinction between the individual phenomena and social phenomena.

1. Jaber presented in his plays' texts aesthetic speech based on guidance and awareness.
2. Through aesthetic discourse, Jaber revealed a study of underlying social and political phenomena.
3. Surprise and ambiguity are the dominant characteristics of Jaber's aesthetic speech in the texts of his plays.

Key words: *Speech, Neamah Jaber, Art, Social Science*



Chapter one: Methodological frame

Research problem

What did the aesthetic speech achieve in Ammar's Neamah Jaber theatrical texts?

Research importance and need

1. The research importance is to know the aesthetic speech and its effect on the drama.
2. To shed light on the aesthetic speech in Ammar's Neamah Jaber theatrical texts.
3. To provide benefit to the students and researchers in colleges and institutes of fine art, and to know what dramatic texts have from aesthetic speeches that contain the author's specific philosophy which reflect on the drama structure.

Chapter two: theoretical frame

Section One: Iraqi society; a sociology study

Social science and its function and most important characters

Social science studies society in its different situations, then studies the individuals and their relations with the society and the reactions between them to form the structure of the society. It also studies the past and the present of the society until reaching to its future by creating a social structure depending on similarities, differences and outer circumstances that effect on the social structure and determine what is private, public and emergency (Ahmad & Kamal, 2019).

Studies refer that the origin of 'sociology' comes from two words: 'sosis' which is Latin and means association, and the word 'logos' which is Greek and means social science. Social science is not like any of the other sciences, but it deals with scientific issues called political science. The first person who used sociology as a word to refer to social science was Auguste Comte (Aron, 2017). Social science studies the early human groups that consider society as a tribal form. People depend on each another to achieve mutual benefits. Most sources refer that Auguste Comte is the spiritual father of social science and that he has described it as less important and more complex than the other sciences.

The earlier omens of this science appear within the philosophical studies, and they start with Plato in 349 BC, in his republic, and with Aristotle in 322 BC, in his theories about politics and society, especially in his book of politics (Bell, 2011). The real need for social science appeared during the seventeenth century, and then new terminologies appeared which explained and framed the science. Politics, social economic, social philosophy and social sciences, all of them under the title of social science, study the systems between all social levels according to the harmony of social action and the mutual relations between levels



(Turner, 2018). Comte disagreed with Plato and Aristotle and considered their opinions that the sociological needed more evidence. Moreover, that reason made him disagree with political theories in the middle ages, especially in Greece. "Romanian philosophers had never added anything to the political theories as Greek philosophers in the middle ages. Religion had a strong effect on people and they were busy in religious issues therefore they had no time for social issues till (renaissance) appeared then people had interest in social issues and searched about what others had reached and added their own opinions" (Maria & Maria, 2017).

Social science has two main functions (Lennart et al., 2015):

1. Firstly: a scientific function that is interested in developing the science and criticism to different works in theoretical and methodological fields in order to give the science the highest level of efficiency and accuracy to reach the social law which science could not reach, if only after a long journey that followed the scientific methodology from noticing until putting into the law.
2. Secondly: a social function which combines that the science is introduced to a specific society until reaching the societies of all humans. This function could have many different jobs including understanding and changing the reality, studying its problems and planning to solve them, whether they were individualism, economic or social that could affect the whole society.

There are three main ways to identify the social sciences, which are (Sigrun Hvalvik & Brendan, 2015):

1. Historical way:

Here we try to identify the basic traditional interest that social science cares for by studying sociological classical writings. In fact, emotions and respect for heritage make us depend on the historical way to identify science subjects. This way provides an opportunity to benefit from the wisdom of old generations and makes us understand subjects that we cannot understand without some knowledge about their past. However, the historical way may cause us to be narrow-minded, since history sometimes cannot solve all the problems of today and into the future.

2. Empiricism way (Wilcox, 2019):

Studies the modern sociological works to identify their subjects. This way is less ambiguous because it does not need any background other than evaluating and measuring. Some interests of modern social scientists' studies may only be special opinions and have no connection with old social scientists' important works. They provide a merely weak hope for the future. Social scientists do not see this way in sociological history as more than a fad and antipode.

3. Analytical or theoretical way (Gilberto et al., 2019):

This way studies a broad subject of science that is specifically abused. The analytical or theoretical way is less used than other ways since it is enough to use some basics of the definition and formulate more phrases of change and thus, it is done.

Montesquieu (1689–1755)

Montesquieu is considered one of the organisers of social science. Although, he has not used functional terms to connect functions with social organising. However, Montesquieu, in his book *The Spirit of the Laws*, distinguishes between three systems of law: republic, monarchy, and dictatorship. The authors consider this classification for governments as a classification for social relations. Therefore, each social and political organisation depends on special beliefs. These beliefs are necessary to keep the organisations of each system honest in monarchy, virtuous in republic and without fear from dictatorship of government. According to these beliefs, Montesquieu declared how laws could help each society to protect political and social organisation's role. He also wrote about religion's role in social stability and then religion's role as law, which must be corresponded with social relations. Montesquieu refused the comparison between the old and the new, which most social scientists depend on, by studying the history of the phenomena. He never depended on the comparison between the old and the new (Aron, 2017; Helen Stout & Li Sun, 2017).

Auguste Comte (1798–1857)

He gave social science its name. In spite of this, Comte was always refusing to identify the branches of social science in detail, but he divided it in to two concepts: 'social statics' and 'social dynamics'. He also solved science subjects depending on this method. These two concepts represented the basic divisions of the social sciences. Comte called the basic part that followed the social science as the 'social dynamic'. If 'statics' was a study of the overlapping between society levels and their interaction with each other, then 'dynamic' should focus on the completed societies (Guillin, 2009). Comte agreed with Montesquieu in depending on the mutual relations between elements, with the social system among them. Social phenomena connected and related with each other, but he refused Montesquieu's classification for social and political systems or the shapes of life in the society. However, Comte was interested in two important parts, which are social constants and social dynamics. Constants means necessary conditions to any society's existence or they are what made the social life possible in the society. While dynamics means social change or factors and reasons that change the society. Comte's mistake is that he connected the jobs with the society instead of the ways of life in that society (Oberdiek, 2018). He endeavoured that the individual should be interacted inside a tyranny character, which means this character controls him completely to produce general centralise. By that, he has limited the freedom of thinking and

gone away towards the tyrannical. In his opinion, he wanted to create a complete social system depending on the authority of controlling with an iron fist because individuals might have different opinions and have unusual arguments (KOBYA, 2018)

Herbert Spencer (1820–1903)

Spencer had a greater ability than Comte to transfer and explain social objects. He referred to the role of the family in building a strong society. Through social science, he explained the appearance of different generations that showed in sequence to represent the adjectives of their ancestors. He did this by studying the relations between these generations, their interactions together and by referring to how the individual can affect his society in a mutual relation as the relation between religion and the sexual criteria and political systems (Adams, 2016). He contributed in forming the principles that the functional structure depended on. Spencer was the first to use the concept of structure and function regularly. He thought that it was useless if we understood the structure without understanding the function that related with it. He described societies as living creatures. His book, *The Principles of Sociology*, analysed the structures and functions of different foundations in the society — including the social, political, religious and economic, among others — and their roles in protecting the societies (David M. et al., 2018). Spencer showed some interest to the religious foundations and emphasised on their role in supporting the religion and the moral sides of an individual. Therefore, they enhanced the social connection. He also mentioned some conditions that should exist in any society to have a completed life which included augmentation (keeping the kind), production (social survival), exchanging (social distribution), connection (nerves-linking function) and behaviour controlling (social organizing) (Perrin, 2018).

Iraqi society

Relations always change the relations between a sociable character and the structure of the society that he lives in. These relations are moveable and are not stable. If one partner changes, the other will change too. Therefore, any changing in the structure and the economic issues can change a human being and his way of thinking. Eventually, these changes will create a new human and open the way for social development (Al-Rikabi, 2019). Society is a compound unit consisting of individuals who are social elements form the family. The family is the first cell in the social structure. Social studies examines it as the smallest social structure from its members, sociology and its relations environment through sequence ages. This is especially the case in Iraqi society, passed through different experiences affected on each individual's psychology and gives each period its special characteristics which come from history, culture and society adjectives by depending on society levels, starting from the Bedouin to the countryside and modernism. Social structures differ from one country to another, according to its forming and its way of dealing with events of foreign control on the

Arabic countries. This controlling may be accepted positively as learning the language and connecting with new culture, as in Arab Maghreb countries. Meanwhile, Iraqi society has never received benefit from this advantage and stilled resisting the occupation with all its power (Hallion, 2015). Iraqi society is formulated from different religious groups and controlled by different beliefs, as in all Arabic societies. It is a hybrid society and has passed through different events and many governments have controlled it, making radical changes in the individuals' dealing and behaviours with each other and with groups. Doctrines have changed them too (Hallion, 2015; Benjamin, 2008).

The Iraqi individual's behaviour is affected by his loyalty to his tribe or cult, which is a form of that individual's character in the society. This results from a weak trust in the government, because of the weakness in its foundations and systems and the appearance of many parties which affect negatively on the unity of public opinion. However, each cult believes in something and each tribe has its own desires and reasons. Combined, the government cannot control its people, especially in Iraqi society because it has many religions, nationalities and cults. Therefore, this situation has affected the national union (18). However, we can find some advantages from these differences in Iraqi society because all of them serve the society. Each cult or nationality has its own culture that will form a hybrid social structure which contains many different cultures. If the national union continued, this mixture produces multi cultures that are considered an important part of the society, with all its types and forms (Hallion, 2015). After this, Al-Wardi came to analyse the Iraqi character through deep studies in sociology between the differences in the social structure according to the nature of the society. The foreign occupation may be useful or not according to each Arabic society's nature, which means that what it applies to Iraqi society, may not apply to Egyptian society (Gutas, 2012).

Section Two: Aesthetic Speech in Theatre Text

Speech is divided into two parts: a written speech, which is on a text form, and an oral speech, which is altered.

1. Written speech: Is a written speech in affixed text which has transferred from thoughts and sounds into fixed forms and contains details of meaning and digress to show it (Gutas, 2012). The written speech contains a group of references and movements of related and long sentence structures and compound sentences, which contain the message and represent a literary speech. Since sound is meaningless, by gathering sounds they will carry thoughts and become a way of communication (Benjamin, 2008). The written speech contains many different concepts and interpretations according to the differences in opinions. Linguistics is the real form of the contrast in real logic to understand the speech and its definitions. Some researchers called it continuous, uttered through it we

can see a series of elements which identify the main elements of written speech including message, the sender, and the receiver. Generally, the speech can be limited by the following items (Al-Rikabi, 2019):

1. The sender (the speaker): he is the main tool in producing the speech
2. The message or the speech text or the oral text
3. The receiver or the message recipient

Here the speech forms the final message that the speaker wants to convey. However, the speech is the general abstract image while the text is the active evidence of it. Following this meaning, we find that the speech differs from the text. The speech is a general look and the text is what it is really has achieved, written and known. The text is the chosen way to convey thoughts and open a wide way to give clear references of messages that the speakers want to transfer to the receiver in a beautiful and creative manner (Benjamin, 2008).

Oral speech

Genette confirmed that "narration and story cannot be unless in a relation with speech". Therefore, speech is a narrative way that can be reached only through a story form. Its narrative feature is one of the reference formulae that contains the text and has a speech relation and sociological structure (Al-Rikabi, 2019).

The French scientist Emil Benvenis considered "the saying became a speech when it identified as an action and has a doer who owned the speech. He had distinguished the saying and the way of its transferring (speech), as well as between what he called self-speech which be in the present tense and in a form of dialogue by the speaker and the listener and the objective speech that narrated in a third person as he was from the past as in historical narration and others" (Robinson, 2003). The speech in the theatre could only be moveable so that the words were replaced by movements. Moreover, silence is one of theatre's speech forms because it is a referenced action. From the characteristics of theatre speech, the speech between characters is meaningless unless it has been read within the relations between these speaking characters and according to the circumstance that its meaning conveys (speech, time, the worlds of different characters). In other words, what it identifies is that the speech meaning of the receiver is in the context from one side and the theatre traditions are from the other side (Robinson, 2003). The most prominent feature of speech is the oral component, by considering it contains a speaker and a receiver. However, it could be in a written form since it is an amount of writings that produce conversations and oral speeches. The use of speech metaphors trick the ways of expressing to shape conversations and oral speeches or for producing the wanted ends (Hibbitts, 1994). Hegel considered art as "a mental need has absolute thought; its aim is the sensual form of the absolute itself. As a result, art is the

beauty that expresses the spirit. He finds the artistically beauty highest than natural beauty because it the production of the spirit and the mind. He said since spirit is highest than nature, therefore its glory transferred to its production, then spiritual art I the real one and what it is excited I matter only for its spiritual side" (Hibbitts, 1994). Since 1920, theatre connected with revolution. The theatre's features affected the events in the real world. Therefore, the theatre is a kind of knowledgeable aesthetic speech that heals many issues or provides documentation for a specific period. It is a means of connection and a diary of events. The period of establishing the modern Iraqi government has witnessed a noticeable development within many aspects of life. Among these aspects is the existence of plays that give interest to the political, economic and social fields. Therefore, the society referred to a new period in cultural fields, especially in theatre. According to this climate, Mahmud Ahmed al-Said's experience appeared, and he was the first one in this field of national play. Mahmud depended on a one-chapter play he authored in 1922, "the lady", which printed in the same year. This play showed the ways of treating the class and natural differences, man's foreignness and losing man's wealth. This play reflected the structure of the general thoughts of Iraqi society at that time. It also had a dramatic structure and an aesthetic speech because it reflected reality between the aristocratic and poverty (Hibbitts, 1994). Then Muhammad Mahdi Baser appeared and his play, "the state of intruders", was printed in 1925 and made a radical change in the history of the Iraqi theatre. Muhammad is a writer, a poet and a political man. His play criticises the British existence by considering them invaders. He also mentioned the disadvantages of colonialism in his play. In other words, that play was a political play (Skukauskaitė, 2012). It contained political and social concepts. Muhammad worked on an important case which was the woman's freedom and calling for her rights with a great criticism of the British existence. He agreed with al-Zahawi's thoughts, who worked during this period on criticising colonialism and the political and social thoughts. That generation pictured life with all its details, as well as his thoughts focused on commitment and social dreams. In 1930, al-Zahawi's play, "Musa al-Shabander", was printed by the al-Marif printing house in Baghdad and classified as a social play (Skukauskaitė, 2012). He wrote the play according to the daily Iraqi life and took its events from the streets of Iraq. The play explored a young orphan woman's life, who lived in her nanny's house and was engaged to her cousin who used to visit her at the house. For that reason, the driver caused her to lapse into a vice with him. However, the heroine was so confident and never gave anyone the chance to accuse her virtue (Hibbitts, 1994).

Section Three: Ammar's Nema Jabber Intellectual References

Creative efforts (the physical and the mental) require an amount of inner power. A creative person has power that enables him to achieve any aim that he wants, by herd working and seeking information. The outer power is related with a proper position. On the other hand, the



inner power is related with knowledgeable desires and discovering reality and searching for new thoughts (Benkler, 2006).

Through a direct link the researcher has made with Ammar Nema, the researcher tries to understand the first reading and its intellectual references when the writer said: at the end of eighth decade, and the beginning of ninth decade from the twenty century I was in a date with the theater through continuous reading and I knew a group of young readers and that created a positive atmosphere to develop my cultural level, especially theater culture. Which meant firstly I know theater by reading the texts, books and magazines that publish theatrical productions. All that after my entering the theater and be in contact with theatrical activities in 1993. These were the first reading, they were very different, and were controlled by my ability to reach the books, since books were expensive and not available at that time under political and economic circumstances that south of Iraq was going through. I was having a book only by chance and by friends and relatives helping. However, at that time I could have books and magazines of famous writers in literary and cultural fields. We in Iraq liked reading so much as the famous proverb described us (Egypt writes, Lebanon prints, Iraq reads). I read poetry, novel, short story, history, philosophy, biographies and many theatrical books, which contained the history of the theater and the biographies of the famous writers. The educated generation, who I had joined to, supported and directed me to have my different educational levels. At that time, I could read theatrical books of various authors from various nationalities who their books had translated and reached Iraq. My first beginnings were with many writings of William Shakespeare, the French writer Muller, the Russian Chekhov and the German Brecht. I had read most of Shakespeare's and Muller's writings. I also read to Bernard show, Sartre, Corneille and Gotha and others unknown theatrical writers I do not remember their names. European literature was the most reachable to the Iraqi reader. My passion to discover and to know more was the main reason to know the progress of the west literary productions at that time. However, I was keen to read Arabic books about theater. I read all writings of Tawfiq AL-Hakim . I also read the texts of Mamduh Adwan and the Iraqi writer Yousef Al- Sayegh, and the poetic theater of Ahmed Shawki. At that period I read continuously about theater and its famous writers generally since Greek era and medieval centuries till arriving the modern ages. All that made me able to form my own character in the theatrical text, which had shaped by understanding and being near to the famous theatrical writers from the beginning till this day (Benkler, 2006).

Philosophy is a way of discovering events and things. It guides us through giving advice by an inferential style and controversy and contradiction to stimulate the mind to think according to specific limits. Although there are not convincing solutions for many issues through contradiction, each science has its philosophy with its origins and effects on the human culture. Therefore, philosophy has an important role in human's objects (Benkler, 2006).



Chapter Three: Research Community

Research Community

In order to limit the research community according to time and spatial limits, the researcher has counted some of Ammar's Nema publishing theatrical texts from 2010-2019. The community has (Colin F. et al., 2018) texts to observe the aesthetic speech by the author in the theatrical texts.

Research sample

The researcher has chosen play "Bottom" as a sample in a poem form according to the following features:

1. The sample models are from different years for diversity
2. Their variety in the objectives for each theatrical text
3. Presenting these texts as theatrical shows on the stage and receiving awards

No	The play	Year
1.	Bottom	2010

Research tool

The researcher depends on the research's theoretical frame as the analytic tool.

Research methodology

The research depends on a descriptive analytic methodology to analyse the research stamp.

The play "Bottom" 2010 (Colin F., et al.,2018):

... between the priest's claim and the life after death and the expected paradise and the character's worldly dreams , there is continuous struggle depending on the clashing of thoughts more than the clashing in material things. The narrator dreams to write his own text which represents his suffering inside the ship at the quarantine chamber after everyone got scabies. The girl sticks to her grandfather, who is unknown to us excepting that had a big position in the past. The lady who is always caring about her withered beauty after her losing to everything by enforcing to marry someone she does not love. The fat one who is always dreaming in food only and the silent professor. However, they all forget that they are at the bottom of the ship , and they are still in hesitating to open the door of the cellar or not. The characters prefer to stay in the cellar even they know that the door was not closed.

.... The text of the play "Bottom" makes the reader realize that the author has understood the game of the play and the features of each character based on a strong dramatic structure. Each character acts according to his inner reasons fluently, which embodies by the conversation between the characters. It had introduced in an aesthetic manner and each character expressed himself/herself fluently.

The fat: (leaving the bed) what happened? Did they brink the breakfast? (Colin F. et al., 2018).

The priest: you do not know about what time I am calling (Benkler, 2006).

The girl: do not mock my grandfather's position ... he has got a place no one has it before at all (Benkler, 2006).

The lady: I am so pretty. Do you see that? (Benkler, 2006).

...the text gives us the impression of being close to the universal texts with some changing in its style. The writer put all characters in the cellar similar to the cellar of Maxim Gorky in his "bottom". Even you can see ways of dealing with the characters' sufferings who do not think about any think except their inner wishes, and forget their main problems, which is leaving the cellar. However, they used to stay in the cellar. After their injured in scabies, they had two choices either healing firstly and then broken the door or broken and then asking for healing. They struggle about these choices and turn against each others. This kind of struggle gives the reader the enjoyment and the desire to know the end and this is Jaber's feature , which makes the reader always thinks about other solutions to solve the main problem.

The narrator: (near to the professor's bed) Shall we wait the door till be opened to heal?

Professor.... Or shall we wait healing to open the door?

The girl: we wait healingand healing will open the door And the door(Benkler, 2006)

.... The ambiguity of the events gives the text an aesthetic element in making a kind of philosophy in the play's theme and in the characters' thoughts. After the struggle about opening the door , Jaber gives more ambiguous event which I that the door is not closed at all but it is opened. Which is an aesthetic situation until getting the whole meaning of the text.

The fat: the door .. the door

The narrator: what happened to the door?



The fat: the door is opened

The professor: the door opened! The door opened (Colin F. et al., 2018)

Chapter four: Results, Conclusions, Recommendations and suggestions

Results

1. There is variety in choosing the subjects to form the theatrical structure that has aesthetic speech.
2. Jaber connected what was objective with the events to create an aesthetic mixture in his speech.
3. He endeavoured to connect between superpower (metaphysics) and realism.

Conclusions

1. Jaber has presented an aesthetic speech in his theatrical texts which are based on guidance and enlightenment.
2. Jaber's aesthetic speech revealed the social and political phenomena.
3. Ambiguity and surprise are the main features in Jaber's aesthetic speech.

Recommendations

1. Holding competitions for one-chapter theatrical texts that express the suffering of the society.
2. Encouraging students to choose Iraqi writers' texts in their annual shows.

Suggestions

1. Studying metaphor in Ammar's Neamah theatrical texts.
2. Studying dialectical conversation in Ammar's Neamah theatrical texts.



REFERENCES

- Mohammadpour, Ahmad, and Kamal Soleimani. "Interrogating the tribal: the aporia of 'tribalism' in the sociological study of the Middle East." *The British journal of sociology* (2019).
- Aron, Raymond. *Main currents in sociological thought: Montesquieu, Comte, Marx, Tocqueville and the sociologists and the revolution of 1848*. Routledge, 2017.
- Bell, Wendell. *Foundations of futures studies: Human science for a new era: Values, objectivity, and the good society*. Transaction Publishers, 2011.
- Turner, Victor. *Dramas, fields, and metaphors: Symbolic action in human society*. Cornell University Press, 2018.
- Kousis, Maria, and Maria Paschou. "Alternative forms of resilience. A typology of approaches for the study of citizen collective responses in hard economic times." *Partecipazione e Conflitto* 10.1 (2017): 136-168.
- Olsson, Lennart, et al. "Why resilience is unappealing to social science: Theoretical and empirical investigations of the scientific use of resilience." *Science advances* 1.4 (2015): e1400217.
- Nyborg, Vibeke N., Sigrun Hvalvik, and Brendan McCormack. "Understanding care in the past to develop caring science of the future: a historical methodological approach." *Scandinavian journal of caring sciences* 32.4 (2018): 1485-1491.
- Wilcox, Nathaniel T. "Commentary: Reflections on Decision Research and Its Empiricism: Four Comments Inspired by Harrison." *Contemporary Philosophy and Social Science: An Interdisciplinary Dialogue* (2019): 139.
- Bermudez-Ruiz, Gilberto, et al. "Meta-Analytical Validity of the Social Entrepreneurship Inventory: A Study of Random Effect Sizes." *Global Journal of Management And Business Research* (2019).
- Aron, Raymond. *Main currents in sociological thought: Montesquieu, Comte, Marx, Tocqueville and the sociologists and the revolution of 1848*. Routledge, 2017.
- De Jong, Martin, Helen Stout, and Li Sun. "Seeing the People's Republic of China through the eyes of Montesquieu: why Sino-European Collaboration on eco city development suffers from European misinterpretations of "good governance"." *Sustainability* 9.2 (2017): 151.



- Guillin, Vincent. *Auguste Comte and John Stuart Mill on sexual equality: historical, methodological and philosophical issues*. Brill, 2009.
- Oberdiek, Hans. "Review Of" *Love, Order, And Progress: The Science, Philosophy, And Politics Of Auguste*" Edited By M. Bourdeau, M. Pickering, And W. Schmaus." (2018).
- KOBYA, Murat. "AUGUSTE COMTE'DA AYDINLANMA VE METAFİZİK TASAVVURU." *Electronic Turkish Studies* 13.26 (2018).
- Adams, Matthew S. "Formulating an anarchist sociology: Peter Kropotkin's reading of Herbert Spencer." *Journal of the History of Ideas* 77.1 (2016): 49-73.
- Hart, David M., et al. "Herbert Spencer, "The Militant Type of Society" (1882)." *Social Class and State Power*. Palgrave Macmillan, Cham, 2018. 147-152.
- Perrin, Robert G. *Herbert Spencer: A primary and secondary bibliography*. Routledge, 2018.
- Al-Rikabi, Nada Khaleefah Mohammed Ali. "The Social Dimension and Its Role in the Applicability of Smart Cities in Iraq." *IOP Conference Series: Materials Science and Engineering*. Vol. 518. No. 2. IOP Publishing, 2019.
- Hallion, Richard. *Storm Over Iraq: Air Power and the Gulf War*. Smithsonian Institution, 2015.
- Benjamin, Marina. *Last Days in Babylon: The Exile of Iraq's Jews, the Story of My Family*. Simon and Schuster, 2008.
- Gutas, Dimitri. *Greek Thought, Arabic Culture: The Graeco-Arabic Translation Movement in Baghdad and Early Abbasid Society (2nd-4th/5th-10th c.)*. Routledge, 2012.
- Robinson, Douglas. *Performative linguistics: speaking and translating as doing things with words*. Routledge, 2003.
- Hibbitts, Bernard J. "Making sense of metaphors: Visuality, aurality, and the reconfiguration of American legal discourse." *Cardozo L. Rev.* 16 (1994): 229.
- Skukauskaite, Audra. "Transparency in transcribing: Making visible theoretical bases impacting knowledge construction from open-ended interview records." *Forum Qualitative Sozialforschung/Forum: Qualitative Social Research*. Vol. 13. No. 1. 2012.
- Benkler, Yochai. *The wealth of networks: How social production transforms markets and freedom*. Yale University Press, 2006.



Camerer, Colin F., et al. "Evaluating the replicability of social science experiments in Nature and Science between 2010 and 2015." *Nature Human Behaviour* 2.9 (2018): 637.

Camerer, Colin F., et al. "Evaluating the replicability of social science experiments in Nature and Science between 2010 and 2015." *Nature Human Behaviour* 2.9 (2018): 637.