Optimising the Role of the West Java Provincial Government in Partnering with the Sister Province of Chongqing

Yusep Ginanjar\textsuperscript{a}, Obsatar Sinaga\textsuperscript{b}, Taufik Hidayat\textsuperscript{c}, Akim\textsuperscript{d},
\textsuperscript{a,b,c,d}Department of International Relations, Padjajaran University, Bandung, Indonesia, Email:\textsuperscript{a}Yusep18001@mail.unpad.ac.id, \textsuperscript{b}Obsatar.sinaga@unpad.ac.id, \textsuperscript{c}Taufik.hidayat@unpad.ac.id, \textsuperscript{d}akim@unpad.ac.id

The practice of diplomacy that has been transformed into new forms presents sub-state entities as new actors. This is known as the paradiplomacy concept, which is carried out by the Government of West Java within the sister province framework with Chongqing Province. As the main actor in the practice of this type of diplomacy, it is expected that the West Java Government can optimise its role in achieving the objectives of its partnership with Chongqing, particularly in economic aspects. This paper uses qualitative methods and data sources are secondary data collected through library research. The purpose of this paper is to identify the factors that can help optimise the role of the West Java Government in the framework of sister province with Chongqing Province. The factors in question include internal factors and external factors. Internal factors include communication, resources, disposition, and policy structures. Last, external factors are Indonesia's security situation and global economic conditions.

Keywords: Diplomacy, Paradiplomacy, Sister Province

Introduction

The pattern of diplomatic relations is inseparable from the influence of politics and the prevailing international system where the external and internal political systems can influence each other. This means that the current pattern of sub-national relations is the result of the mutual interaction of a country's external and internal systems. For example, Indonesia's Law
No. 23/2014 added with Substitute Law No. 9/2015 relating to local government and authority in conducting international relations. Indonesia’s Law No. 23/ 2014 regulates executive and judicial authority in the context of international relations. So it can be said that at this point, the process of implementing democracy in Indonesia has been in a position where the activities of nation and state life are under the expectations of democracy itself, including issues of diplomacy and international relations (Damayanti, 2012).

Diplomacy is no longer an independent practice that can only be carried out by the government and diplomats. The complexity of issues in international relations already shifted from the issue of high politics to low politics, allowing other actors besides state actors to participate in the practice of diplomacy. This requires the state to involve other parties to support all efforts to implement the practice of diplomacy, one of which is the local government. For example, Indonesia’s Substitute Law No. 9/2015 became the legal basis for the implementation of international relations by local governments. This is based on the consideration that the local government understanding of its own needs and potential. This is important because it can maximise the results of the implementation of diplomatic practices so that they become more effective and efficient. Morgentahau (1961 in Damayanti) said that diplomacy is an essential part of a nation's national strength in addition to its resources, geographical conditions, industrial and military capabilities, population, and quality of government.

**Figure 1. Diplomacy Tracks**

[Diagram showing various diplomacy tracks including Government, Funding, Professional Conflict Resolution, Business, Religion, Peace Activism, Research, Training, and Education, Private Citizen, and Inner Circle: Media and Public Opinion. Source: Beyond Intractability.org]
West Java Province is one of the provinces in Indonesia that often has partnerships with foreign countries in the framework of paradiplomacy. The partnership between the West Java Provincial Government of Indonesia and the Provincial Government of Chongqing of the People's Republic of China within the sister province framework is an example of paradiplomacy practices in Indonesia. The basis of the collaboration between West Java and Chongqing is the cooperation between the Indonesian government and the Government of the People's Republic of China through the China National Tourism Administration (CNTA) in 2015 and revitalised in 2018 (Kemenpar, 2018). Sister province conducted by the Provincial Government of West Java and the Provincial Government of Chongqing is a manifestation of the concept of paradiplomacy with sub-national subjects. This is as the implication from the rapid change of the phenomenon and the issue of international relations, namely from an issue that is identical to the feud and conflict between countries to the issue of cooperation (Rudi, 2003). Along with the shifting issues in international relations, it automatically makes the actors in international relations now also develop. These developments are from the central government; in this case, the state in components under the state or even outside the state—for example, sub-national actors. The emergence of sub-national actors, in this case, is a representation of the central government that can carry out foreign relations and carry out interactions with a sub-national territory in a country according to their respective levels and their interests are even more specific (Wolff, 2009).

Since the establishment of a strategic partnership between China and Indonesia in 2005, China's economic and trade relations with West Java as Indonesia's sub-national unit have developed rapidly. China has established its first national industrial park in Indonesia and the China-Indonesia Economic and Trade Zone, in Bekasi Regency. China is actively involved in infrastructure development in West Java. Chinese companies have participated in the construction of Indonesia's largest water conservancy project, Jati Gede Dam, one of the 10 million kilowatts of Indonesia's first thermal power project, Indramayu Power Plant, and the Bandung Toll Road to Cirebon and other significant projects with West Java Provinces. Moreover, the paradiplomacy practice that West Java practised also includes a partnership with the provinces of Heilongjiang in the framework of sister province. Guangxi Nanning City and Bogor City also reached a consensus on the formation of sister city. In addition, the Chinese government has agreed to give Indonesia a pair of giant pandas, and the Bogor Wildlife Park is expected to be a new home for giant pandas in Indonesia. China is happy that the friendly relations between the two parties have developed and are increasingly close.

The Chinese Ambassador, Liu stressed that West Java is rich in natural resources and is the most populous province in Indonesia, also the centre of Indonesia's textile industry and a major grain-producing region. The capital of Bandung has a long history and culture and is a famous education city. The potential for mutually beneficial cooperation between China and West Java is enormous. Both parties can focus on strengthening relations in infrastructure
development, the textile industry, agriculture, tourism and education in the future (Chineseembassy.org, 2017). On the other hand, the declaration of regional sister provinces, including overseas, has been outlined in the Regional Medium-Term Development Plan (RPJMD) for the 2013-2018 period. In addition, the West Java Provincial Government has also made a Grand Design of Regional Cooperation (GDKD) which contains programs, activities, strategies, and regional cooperation models for the next 5 (five) years (Andrias, 2018). The Government of West Java Province In 2015, it approached various provinces and at the same time established relationships related to different fields, namely economy, culture, education, and human resources. One of the provinces targeted by sister province to be run by West Java is Chongqing Province.

China, in general, is an important partner, not only for Indonesia but also for West Java. It was stated that China became the third country with the highest foreign investment value in West Java (Detik News, 2017). But in 2018, China is not included in the top five countries with the highest amount of investment for West Java (Tribunnews.com, 2018). The five countries are Japan, Singapore, the Netherlands, South Korea and Brazil. Yet when signing a memorandum of understanding (MoU) between West Java and four provinces in China including Chongqing, it is predicted to be an opportunity for increased Chinese investment in West Java (Detiknews.com, 2017). This is undoubtedly a question why the targets that the West Java Government is trying to achieve cannot be realised. Therefore, this research will study the optimisation of the role of the West Java Government in establishing sister province partnerships, especially with Chongqing Province.

In general, research on the potential of sister province conducted between the Provincial Government of West Java and Chongqing Province has been carried out by Andrias (2018). The research focuses on the potential that can be collaborated between West Java Province and Chongqing Province. In the research, at least there are five potential sectors that can be seen from Chongqing province, namely (1) strategic location; (2) infrastructure; (3) industrial sector; (4) research and development; and (5) various other market potentials. This paper will focus on the implementation of sister province on boosting the infrastructure and manufacturing sectors. This is because the two sectors can significantly increase the economies growth of both parties. Moreover, Indonesia is intensifying improvements in both sectors, one of which can be supported by the successful partnership between West Java and Chongqing considering that West Java has succeeded in meeting the investment target from Indonesia’s central government (Detiknews.com, 2017).

Literature Review

A literature study is important to understand the research problems and to know the novelty of the research conducted. Other research that is used as a reference is then reviewed for
similarities, differences and contributions to this paper. In this paper, three studies are used as references.

The first research referred to in this paper is *Paradiplomacy: The Rise of Local Actors in International Fora*, written by Takdir Ali Mukti. This journal has something in common with this paper because it discusses the same big theme, paradiplomacy. Mukti explained in his journal how the emergence of the phenomenon of paradiplomacy and giving an overview of how paradiplomacy is carried out by subnational entities in developed countries. The difference between this journal and this paper is the focus of the theme of the research. Mukti’s journal discusses the practice of paradiplomacy in general. Then this paper more specifically discusses the practice of sister province, which is part of paradiplomacy. Mukti's contribution to this paper is to provide an understanding of paradiplomacy and its practice in developed countries as a comparison of paradiplomacy practices in Indonesia.

The second study referred to in this paper is *Paradiplomacy and Climate Change: the American States as Actors in Global Climate Governance* written by Thomas D. Eatmon. In this journal, there is a similarity with the paper to be written, which is the same big theme, paradiplomacy. Otherwise, there are some differences between the Eatmon journal and this paper. First, Eatmon focuses on the practice of paradiplomacy in terms of environmental aspects, while this paper focuses on economic aspects. Second, if in the journal Eatmon the level of analysis used is the states in the United States, then this paper is provincial analysis, specifically the Province of West Java in Indonesia. This journal specifically discusses how the practice of paradiplomacy is carried out by the states in the United States as a response to climate change problems. This is interesting because the United States did not ratify the international agreement to limit carbon emissions, but states have different policies so that states as sub-state entities have the power to determine their policies. The contribution of this journal is to provide an overview and understanding of how power distribution does occur between the state and the entities under it. To illustrate that the practice of paradiplomacy is not only limited to supporting state diplomacy but also changing the direction of policy at the national level.

The third study referred to in this paper is Paradiplomacy and the International Competitiveness of Cities: the case of Rio de Janeiro, written by Marcos Vinicius Isaias Mendes and Ariane Roder Figueira. The third journal has similarity with this paper because it discusses the theme of paradiplomacy. The difference from the third journal with this paper is, if the third journal discusses sister city practices, then this paper will discuss sister province practices carried out by West Java Province. The contribution of this third journal is to provide an overview and understanding of the significance and competitive side of subnational entities in international politics independently. This journal explained how the Rio
de Janeiro process in being able to host the 2016 Summer Olympics, starting from its efforts to increase resource capacity and also attempts to improve its image globally.

Research Method

The research method used to analyse the problems in this paper is a qualitative method. Qualitative method is used to identify the factors that can reduce the effectivity of West Java Government to achieve an optimum role in the practice of sister province with Chongqing comprehensively. The data obtained will be presented in the form of words generated from the observations and understanding of researcher because the researcher is the main instrument in the study (Moelong, 2007). The data source used in this paper is secondary data, where the author collects relevant information and data from books, articles, journals, documents, and internet browsing. In other words, the data collection technique used in this paper is the study of literature. Analysis of the data obtained in this paper is done by reading and collecting various data sources which are then grouped according to research needs until finally sorted out, which can explain the research phenomenon. Finally, to test the validity of the overall data, researchers used triangulation of data sources by comparing data from various existing sources.

Discussion

Diplomacy is no longer seen as a means to carry out a country's foreign policy for the sake of high political interests, but rather to connect culture, economic needs, society and others that are at the level of low politics (Lee and Hocking, 2011). This is evidenced by the practice of paradiplomacy. Paradiplomacy is the development of traditional diplomacy in which the distribution of power from the state to the entities under it occurs to carry out foreign relations. This practice in Indonesia can be realised with the concept of regional autonomy which provides flexibility for each region to manage and maximise all of its potential, including establishing partnerships with other entities abroad. The practice of paradiplomacy itself not only believed beneficial for the parties concerned but further contribute to the overall acquisition of national interests and help to smooth the diplomatic process carried out between the countries involved.

The implementation of paradiplomacy itself is a series of interactions between one sub-national actor and a sub-national actor who is part of another country (Suryokusumo, 2004). The implementation of this diplomacy varies, but it must still be approved or facilitated by the central government as the official representation of a country. Lecours (2008) also said that the purpose of conducting paradiplomacy would be varied, such as entities with equal capabilities will promote each other's identity and capabilities. In contrast, if the entities have different capabilities, there will be a complementary relationship where one party obtains
knowledge, and the other party gets resources. Paradiplomacy activities will help sub-national actors such as local governments to sell various potential collaborations they have to other parties, especially in the term of trade and investment (Mukti, 2013). This is reinforced by the statement from President Barrack Obama, who said the urgency of implementing paradiplomacy is to answer the challenges and opportunities of the global economic conditions (Sister cities org, 2013). Moreover, the economic aspect is not the only focus; it is also related to building mutual understanding and trust, also means of sharing technology and culture that is shared between communities that carry out partnerships.

Paradiplomacy practice in Indonesia, both sister province and sister city are regulated and justified through a series of regulations (Mukti, 2013), including; Law No. 37/1999 concerning Foreign Relations, Law No. 24/2000 concerning International Treaties, and Law Number 32/2004 concerning Regional Governments and Law Number 23 of 2014. These regulations are intended for paradiplomacy implementation, that is carried out by the principle of proportionality without exceeding the authority of the state. In the literature mentioned, there are several levels of practice paradiplomacy. In Indonesia, most forms of partnerships with foreign countries carried out by local governments are included in the level of paradiplomacy with the form of involving aspects of sister province/city (Lecours, 2008). This kind of paradiplomacy practice is a form of partnership that is quite strategic but is limited in certain aspects. For example, in this case, the sister province conducted by the Government of West Java covers many fields of cooperation but is limited to economic, social and cultural aspects.

West Java is one of the provinces in Indonesia which has not only the strength of its population but also has significance for the Indonesian economy in general. As one of the most populous provinces, the West Java economy can move the Indonesian economy through various sectors. However, data shows that economic growth in West Java in the second quarter of 2018 grew slowly compared to the first quarter of 2018 from 5.96% to 5.65%, although it increased from the previous year (Bank Indonesia 2018). According to Bank Indonesia, the slowdown in the economic growth rate of West Java in the second quarter of 2018 was caused by slowing growth in investment and net exports abroad. Meanwhile, in terms of business fields, the rate of growth of the majority of business fields in West Java, especially the central business fields, namely the manufacturing, trade and construction industries also helped curb economic growth in West Java. The increasing economic growth in West Java was mainly supported by a number of events, such as the Pilkada and the Asian Games, which could increase private and government consumption, as well as investment. In addition, the continued development of a number of Government strategic infrastructure projects in 2018 will also contribute to economic growth. As for analysis at the global level, the continuing improvement in the global economy and global commodity prices are also expected to support overseas export performance.
Chongqing Province is the economic centre in Western China because of its location in the upper reaches of the Yangtze River. It is the starting line of the Silk Road Economic Belt, also has direct train services to Europe: Yuxinou Railway (Urban China Hypotheses.org, 2015). China is a country that is known as an emerging power in the global economy. The existence of a Chinese trade route known as ‘One Belt One Road’ and ‘YangTze River Economic Belt’ as a form of China's economic ambition confirms the significant position of Chongqing for China. Chongqing considers that West Java is the right place to invest because the security situation is relatively conducive. As for West Java, Chongqing is a strategic partner to forge partnerships, especially with plans to build a monorail infrastructure, a high number of Chongqing tourists, and also technology owned by Chongqing. More important is the partnership can be done because both have similarities geographically and geologically (Bappeda Jabar, 2018). Role identification of West Java Government in this sister province framework can be studied based on internal and external factors so that the role of West Java can be optimised.

**Internal Factors**

In sister province framework with Chongqing, West Java has formulated a set of policies that can optimise its role in achieving the expected goals. In other words, the effectiveness and efficiency of policies can be used as optimal parameters for the part of the West Java Government as an actor in partnerships and decision-makers. Several variables determine the effectiveness of policy implementation, according to George C. Edwards III, including (Windiani, 2014).

**Figure 2.** Determinant Variables of Policy Implementation (George C. Edwards III)

![Determinant Variables of Policy Implementation](image)

a. Communication

Communication is one of the essential factors that can support role optimisation of the West Java Government in the framework of sister province with Chongqing Province. The intended communication is how the West Java Government communicates the objectives and implementation of its policies to the stakeholders. Stakeholders are not only meant the Chongqing Government as partners or central government that supervise the partnership. Furthermore, it is necessary to communicate with academics, practitioners and also public in general who are also considered as stakeholders. By conducting communication in the form of dialogue, it is hoped that the Government of West Java will be able to accommodate the aspirations of various layers of society and obtain maximum results. This is because of the real purpose of paradiplomacy practice is to improve the welfare of the region and the people in it.

b. Human Resources

The next important factor is resources, both human and natural resources owned by the region. West Java, in establishing a partnership with Chongqing focuses on economic aspects. Therefore, the Government of West Java needs to increase the capacity and capability of human resources in West Java through a series of training and seminars to be able to optimise its role. This is important because, without the support of competent human resources, maximum results will not be achieved. Therefore, this point is closely related to the communication point as a means to involve the community in general. In addition, with the entry of foreign investment, it is expected to open new opportunities for the people of West Java, both those looking for employment or want to build their businesses. Foreign investment must not be marginalised local community, but must empower them. The provision of this training can be supported by funds from the central government, as improving the quality of human resources in various regions in Indonesia to be ready to compete at the global level is a necessity.

c. Disposition

The West Java government, as the leading implementer in the sister province partnership with Chongqing Province, needs to have some quality as a decision-maker. These qualities include honesty, integrity, commitment, communication and negotiation skills, also other supporting qualities. This is important so that the practice of paradiplomacy is not only seen as a chance for free travel abroad. The regional government of West Java needs to understand that the partnership is done for the sake of common goals and prosperity. These qualities are essential so that the partnership can last for an extended period of time and have clear objectives both in the short, medium, and long term. In order to realise this, synergy with foreign ministry is
also needed to review regional capacity and capability in implementing international partnerships.

In 2017 Ahmad Heryawan as governor of West Java at that time along with a group consisting of government and cooperation bureaus, the Office of Investment and Services, as well as the integrated transportation service and from the Ministry of Domestic Affairs visited China precisely to the province of Choungqing. At that time Ahmad Heryawan as governor strongly agreed to hold a collaboration between West Java Province and Choungqing Province within the framework of Sister Province.

In 2017 a memorandum of understanding was agreed upon and then signed by both parties. After agreeing, the derivative work program is created and implemented. The first to be carried out was in 2018 concerning tourism and culture regarding the holding of a collaboration event which had the title "Sister Province Night". The activity contained about a number of businesses, exhibitions of economists and trade and what followed was art and cultural event held in West Java and Choungqing Provinces. The implementation of these activities is due to the extraordinary support from the Choungqing PPIT community. According to the official managing agency for foreign cooperation planning, Biya Mulky said that after the term of governor Ahmad Heryawan ended in June 2018 then was replaced by Ridwa Kamil. There was a transfer of power and a change in policy and regulation from the West Java regional government regarding the cooperation between choungqing and West Java. Differences in views make one of the changes made. The concentration of ridwan kamil is rarer in other countries because it considers very little profit gained from cooperation with Choungqing. Therefore Ridwan Kamil turned out to be more interested in other countries such as South Australia, Al-Zajair, and Japan.

d. Policy Structure

The role optimisation can be done by the West Java Government through the efficiency of the bureaucracy in its organisation. So that in each stage of the process it can be known who is authorised and responsible. In addition, it is necessary to avoid overlapping authority because it will reduce the effectiveness and efficiency of the Government of West Java. This can be done by compiling a series of existing tasks, then dividing these tasks for each department/section and then appointing the person in charge. For example, the West Java One-Stop Investment and Integrated Services Office has the authority to take care of investments entering West Java. This office also made a three-hour licensing innovation as part of the promotion of the West Java Government so that investors would be interested in investing. This not only supports the entry of foreign investment, but it also shows the significant role of the West Java Government in attracting investment and carrying out profitable international partnerships.
External Factors

In addition to internal factors, external factors also influence the role of the Government of West Java to optimise its role in achieving goals in partnership with Chongqing. Although these factors do not directly affect the role of the West Java Government, they can still influence the course of the partnership and the policy direction to be taken by the Government of West Java. The external factors include:

a. Indonesia's Security Situation

It cannot be denied that international politics will influence and be influenced by domestic politics in various countries. In establishing foreign partnerships, the situation and conditions in Indonesia must be conducive, so it will be able to attract foreign partners to establish a partnership. One factor that causes West Java to become a favourite area for foreign investors is due to the conducive and safe condition of West Java, besides of course the availability of various resources (Detiknews.com, 2017). Therefore, things that have the potential to disrupt domestic stability must be muted. The efforts that can be made by the Government of West Java, in this case, are to actively promote the potential of the region in international forums to be able to convince investors to invest in West Java.

b. Global Economic Conditions

In planning and practising partnerships, including sister provinces, observing the global situation is an essential factor in supporting efforts to achieve the expected goals. A very dynamic global condition requires actors that able to adapt to all changes that occur, especially in the economic aspect, which change is something that happens at any time. Therefore, to optimise its role in partnership with Chongqing, the Government of West Java needs to examine what are the current global needs, what issues are strategic issues and which parties can be promising partners. This is important because even though the partnership established is under the supervision of the foreign ministry; it is the West Java Government that must be more proactive. This is in accordance with the purpose of paradiplomacy, which is primarily to empower non-state actors so that they are not limited only to meeting the needs of their regions but further supporting state diplomacy. Often partnerships established within this paradiplomacy framework experience stagnation due to the unpreparedness of local governments to establish partnerships with partners abroad. Such unpreparedness includes a lack of research on partners who will become partners in practising paradiplomacy.
Conclusion

Foreign partnerships carried out by the local government, especially in the sister province framework by West Java Province with Chongqing Province is still not fully optimal in achieving the expected targets. Optimising the role of the West Java Government is important because it is the local government that knows all the needs and resources that it has. In addition, in the practice of sister province, local governments are the main actors, although it must be approved by the central government through the Ministry of Foreign Affairs. Optimising the role of local governments can be done if internal and external factors that can reduce role optimisation are identified, and solutions are found. Both internal and external factors that influence policy formulation in sister province practice between West Java Province and Chongqing Province affect the implementation of the partnership. The factors that affect the role of West Java Government are communication, resources, disposition, policy structures, Indonesia's security situation, and global economic conditions.
REFERENCES


