



Learning Supervision Strengthening Based on School Culture in Kindergarten

Ahmad Samawi^a, Imron Arifin^b, Bambang Budi Wiyono^c, Ali Imron^d

^aEarly Childhood Teacher Education, State University of Malang, ^bDepartment of Educational Administration, State University of Malang, ^cDepartment of Educational Administration, State University of Malang, ^dDepartment of Educational Administration, State University of Malang

Email: ^aahmad.samawi.fip@um.ac.id ^bimron.arifin.fip@um.ac.id ^cbambang.budi.fip@um.ac.id
^dali.imron.fip@um.ac.id

This study aims to describe the strengthening of school culture-based learning using qualitative research methods with phenomenological designs. This study was conducted in three superior kindergartens in the city of Malang. The research design used was multisite qualitative research. Sources of data came from principals and teachers in the three kindergartens. The instruments used were guidelines for interviews, observation and documentation. Data collection techniques used were in-depth interviews, observation, documentation and field notes. The analysis technique used was qualitative and descriptive with a phenomenological technique. The results of this study are that three kindergartens have made supervision planning. The techniques used were determined as individual through classroom observation. The results of supervision were followed up by the teachers. The implementation of supervision was carried out with the developed schools' cultural principles, namely openness, collaboration, empowerment, cooperation, democracy and religious principles. It was concluded that supervision of learning can be strengthened through school culture.

Keywords: *learning supervision, school culture, kindergarten*



Introduction

Early childhood is very sensitive to environmental influences, especially families and schools. Research conducted by Pramono (2019) found that motoric development, social emotions, language, cognition, morality and art in early childhood were developed very fast during the early stages of growth carried out through CE2IG play and play activities. The ability of teachers to develop early childhood is very important. Thus, there is a need for continuous coaching. Teacher guidance through supervision activities is needed to develop PAUD into a modern educational organisation (Prasojo, 2011). However, this still experiences cultural factors constraints (Garman, 1982). Supervision activities have not been carried out professionally because of the quality of supervisors (Rahman, 2016). Consequently, most teachers rarely receive guidance. As a result, supervisors have not been able to help teachers carry out learning well. Research conducted by Garza, E, Jr. found teachers' organisational behaviour to be very effective in advancing schools. Leadership involving this principal is needed to encourage effective school change (Garza, 2014). Another study conducted by Maisyaroh et al. found that there was a significant correlation between supervision, frequency and the application of the principle of supervision with teacher learning skills (Maisyaroh, et. al. 2017).

Teacher guidance through supervision is very important. Considering its success will determine the quality of human resources in PAUD institutions. Paul and Anantharaman's (2003) research shows that the analysis of causal models, organisational operations and financial performance can be practically improved. In fact, Donkoh and Dwamena (2014) found educational supervision has a significant influence on the professional abilities of teachers. This include their ability to develop curriculum, develop methods, develop materials, conduct classroom management, identify student characteristics and evaluate learning. Instruction supervision is herein defined as: behaviour officially designed by an organisation that directly affects teacher behaviour in such a way as to facilitate pupil learning and achieve the goals of the organisation (Anshori, et. al. 2017).

Most of the foundation and non-permanent teachers are not civil servant teachers. They have not yet been certified, so they have not received professional allowances. Thus, they do not focus on developing professional learning. They remain as PAUD teachers because they feel that income is not the main factor and are not seeking profit (Samawi, et. al. 2016).

The development of PAUD into a modern educational organisation requires excellent teacher guidance from supervisors. However, the parties related to the guidance have not paid attention to improvement through supervision activities. The obstacle faced is the existence of an organisational mindset or culture among PAUD practitioners. They still consider traditional PAUD organisations to be less important than others. In addition, the professional abilities of teachers and principals have not yet been maximally developed. According to Misran Rahman, the low quality of learning in PAUD is influenced by the quality of supervisors who do not have experience as teachers. PAUD heads and their educational qualifications, for at least four years, have not been PAUD (Rahman, 2016). The results of Samawi, et. al.'s (2016) research revealed that most of the teachers and PAUD heads rarely received learning guidance from supervisors. Based on preliminary studies through

interviews, it is known that teachers' perceptions of supervisors are very diverse. PAUD teachers argued that supervisors lack understanding of early childhood material. The latter involves characteristics of early childhood, learning resources, methods, designs, PAUD learning techniques and PAUD evaluation systems.

Glickman explained that the goals and functions of a supervision include: (1) helping teachers develop their competencies, (2) developing curricula, (3) developing teacher groups and guiding classroom action research (Glickman, et. al. 2009). According to the research of Garza, E, Jr, the ability of teachers and principals in organisational behaviour is very effective in advancing schools (Garza, 2014). Today, supervision in this investigation, as in the one discussed earlier, seems to be characterised by strain and tension. Supervisors are seen as distant and much of what goes on in supervision is artificial and ritualised. Of course, there is no claim that supervision is all the same wherever it is to be found (Wiyono, 2009).

Methodology

Research Data

Data was collected through observation, in-depth interviews, documentation and field notes. The data was obtained from primary informants, namely principals and kindergarten teachers. To check the validity of the data, triangulation of sources, techniques and results was carried out. Data collection focused on:

1. Supervision planning
2. Supervision material
3. Implementation of supervision
4. Evaluation
5. School culture
6. Principles
7. Approaches
8. Techniques

This study uses a qualitative, multi-site research design (Huberman and Miles, 2019). The presence of researchers is needed to see firsthand natural phenomena (naturalistic) that occur in kindergarten. Researchers were present at Pembina I Kindergarten Jalan Cibogo 01 Malang, which has the characteristics of a public school, Alfadholi Kindergarten Street Kertojoyo 9 Malang, which has the characteristics of Islamic boarding schools and ABA Kindergarten 26, which has the characteristics of modern religious organisations. Pembina Kindergarten has 190 students who were taken care of by 16 teachers. A total of 160 children were taken care of by 15 teachers in Al Fadholi Kindergarten. ABA Kindergarten 26 accommodated 329 children who were taken care of by 18 teachers. The Head of the Pembina Kindergarten was 52 years old with a Master's Degree. The ABA Kindergarten was led by a 45-year-old teacher who is also the head of the Kindergarten. The Al Fadholi Kindergarten Head, who is the youngest (35 years old), has a Master Degree. They have different leadership styles according to their age and character. Researchers are instruments, so the presence of researchers is needed. The instruments developed in this study were guidelines for

observation, documentation and in-depth interviews. A questionnaire was used to collect data on the assessment of obstacles and difficulties in conducting supervision in PAUD. Interviews are used to collect supervision process data that cannot be collected by other instruments. The data is verbal data from the informants of the research subject.

The data analysis technique used in this research is the phenomenological descriptive analysis technique. It follows the steps of the data presentation, data reduction and conclusion. This phenomenological descriptive analysis technique is used to analyse the process of internalising the strengthening of school cultural values in the supervision of learning in kindergarten.

Result and Discussion

Supervision of school culture-based learning can be seen in the planning, implementation, evaluation and follow-up programs made by the principal as a supervisor in the classroom. Planning of learning supervision has been done by the three school principals. Based on Table 1, it can be seen that the three kindergarten heads made supervision plans in the form of a schedule. However, the implementation was very flexible depending on the activities of the principal, teachers and schools. When the kindergarten received a visit from another institution, the schedule was changed and reorganised. The activities of supervision of learning were only carried out by the principal once a semester. According to the teachers, it should be at least once every three months. The supervision schedule was delivered by the school principal at the beginning of the semester in the teacher meeting. Even though planning has been made, the frequency of supervision is rarely done so that teachers are given the freedom to submit supervision of learning in their class. This is in accordance with the findings of Samawi, Wulandari and Aisyah (2016). They found that teachers rarely get learning coaching from supervisors.

Based on these findings, the proposition that can be put forward is the frequency of learning supervision will affect teachers' performance. This corresponds to the research of Maisyaroh, et. al., which says (2017) that the frequency and principle of supervision has a significant effect on the ability of teachers in teaching. The vision and mission of a school that is understood diversely requires the same understanding so that it can be realised to develop the school. This requires guidance and supervision from the school principal when facing increasingly complex challenges in life. This finding is in accordance with the findings of Lisdayanti dan Santoso (2019). According to Santoso, guidance and supervision is needed because of differences in visions, missions, capabilities, skills, personalities and the demands of the public services in an increasingly complex work world. Knezovic and Musrati (2014) indicate that employees' creativity can contribute to organisational effectiveness, innovation and survival. Susanto, Novitasari, Yusuf, dan Ilfiandra (2015) indicate that CPI serves as a reliable self-report to measure the creative personality of students with a reliability coefficient of 0.911. Wiles dan Lovell (1987) indicates that supervision is service activity that endeavours to help teachers do their job better.

The material of learning supervision has the same pattern, although there are slight variations. When the principal is either asked by a teacher or scheduled to carry out supervision in the class, the aspect



that is asked involves the instruments of learning. These instruments are a year program, semester program, RPPM, RPPH, media, learning resources and evaluation tools. A principal participated in class and observed the learning preparation and its completeness. When he encountered media that was deemed inappropriate, he said, 'How is the media used in learning activity? What if that media was made using the material that can be recycled into media? It can save costs can't it?.' The teacher answered with a wry smile, 'Oh yes. That's right. Why didn't I think of that?' The sentence used was a polite sentence that gave an opportunity for self-evaluation. This is consistent with Bambang Budi Wiyono's previous research indicating that the headmasters' informal leadership and motivation of teachers can improve schools (Wiyono, et. al. 2014). The results of observations are then described in the observation instrument by the school principal. The results are then generally presented at teacher meetings and become other learning material.

Supervision implementation according to the planned schedule is once per semester, unless there is a teacher who requests it. However, very few teachers submit supervisory visits to school principals. The principal sees that the combination of a PAUD teacher teaching team and basic religion teacher as a good team that provides good strengthening of learning for children. A review of the observations is then discussed together with the class teacher team. The supervision technique that is used by principals at three more sites is more direct. This is consistent with the results of Anshori's research, Imron, Maisyaroh, that the direct technique used by supervisors is performed by direct communication with the teacher. Evaluation of the principal's supervision of teacher is in the form of evaluation of the process and results. Evaluation of the learning process uses teacher a performance assessment tool (APKG 1). This is used to assess the learning plan made by the teacher and the teacher performance assessment tool (APKG 2), which assesses the performance of the teacher in implementing the learning process. Through the APKG, the principal can assess behaviour during the learning process and assess the results of supervision. This involves measuring the success of coaching in the form of successful learning outcomes of children (Wiyono, et. al. 2014).

Sonhaji (1984) indicates that in the implementation of multicultural education and learning at four locations above, in the identification of ethnicity and local cultural diversity in the community, the application of multicultural education and learning at schools is strategic and effective. These programs strengthen nationalism and national unity. School culture that seems to be the basis of learning supervision includes thoughts, attitudes and behaviours that schools have, especially principals and teachers. School culture in the form of religious culture can be seen in the arrangement of good culture regarding writing, attitudes, speech and behaviour in accordance with religious teachings. What are the core values that transform a school into an effective institution? Schools are for students. Experimentation with teaching and learning are cooperative processes. One should stay close to their students, strive for academic excellence, be open in behaviour and communication, trust colleagues and be professional (Wiles and Lovell, 1987). Supervision is a process that includes many human behaviour variables. According to Caruso and Fawcett (2007), supervision was influenced by many factors. These include thinking style, cultural background, intelligence, personality, experience and level of development. Bogahalande, Ahamed and Teng (2019) indicate that to show leadership authenticity, organisational culture and innovativeness were



significant. The findings also assured that the dimensions of organisational culture (involvement and consistency) partially mediated the relationship between authentic leadership and organisational innovativeness. This concept requires a transformational leadership concept and skills: (1) The leader acts as a mentor who models sharing behaviour by establishing trust, empathy and two-way communications. (2) They encourage and motivate creative thought among the students (Minter, 2011).

The finding of Supriono et al (2018) indicates that the instructional supervisory orientation was developed on the basis of the teachers' seniority, willingness, motivation and capability. The orientation used appropriate situational teachers' supervisors' connective communication actions to provide professional assistance that effectively related to the teachers' increase in motivation, willingness, commitment and capability in terms of the competences and performances. It also used these actions in the attainment of the better learning outcomes. Kalule and Bouchamma (2014) indicate that supervisors' socio-cognitive characteristics, particularly the internal perception of professional efficacy, were the factors associated with the choice of supervisory practice the most. Culturally responsive teachers understand culture in general (their own culture and other cultures). They believe that a culturally diverse classroom is a resource for themselves and their students. They also utilise their students' cultural assets to enhance teaching and learning. Culturally responsive teachers believe that every student can learn and they assume responsibility for that learning. They develop positive relationships with their students and their students' families and communities. Culturally responsive teachers understand that students from different cultures communicate differently and they adjust their communication accordingly. They differentiate instruction and allow students to demonstrate their growth in different ways. Culturally responsive teachers help students to value academics and equip them to succeed in the real world. They also prepare them to change that world [9]. The findings of Huang and Hsiao (2007) indicate that, among the predictors of commitment, the perception of job characteristics is the strongest determinant. In the equation of satisfaction, when all effects are compared, the predictability of job characteristics shows the largest influence. Furthermore, working conditions and organisational climate have significant and positive impacts on satisfaction and commitment. This implies that redesigning job contents and changing management styles are two useful strategies for management to promote employees' satisfaction and commitment.

The school leadership culture displayed by the Head of Pembina Kindergarten is more likely to be a non-directive democratic approach. The leadership style of Al Fadholi Kindergarten's Principal is directed more towards non collaborative directives (Glickman, et. al. 2009). The principal behaviour of the supervisor in the non-directive view includes listening, clarifying, encouraging, presenting and negotiating. The desired result of the non-directive supervisor is the development of a teacher self-plan. Supervisory behaviour, in the non-directive approach, is as follows: (1) listening, (2) strengthening, (3) explaining, (4) presenting and (5) solving problems.

In general, the three Kindergartens used certain principles in carrying out supervision activities. These principles are friendliness, politeness, democracy, harmoniousness, constructiveness and



problem solving. The findings of Maisyaroh (2012) indicate that there is a significant positive correlation between the frequency and principles of supervision implementation and the teacher's teaching skills. This finding is in accordance with the findings of Wiyono et al. (2009) indicating that proper planning, implementation, evaluation, principles and supervision techniques will encourage the improvement of a teaching teacher's ability. The approach used is directive and non-directive. These aspects of supervision encourage schools strive towards excellence. This finding is in line with Sriwahyuni's 2015 research that found the excellence of kindergarten lies its location, management, peculiarities and leadership of school principals (Wayne and Miske, 2008). Similarly, Nurochmah (2017) indicated that there are several strategies needed by principals to enhance education quality: (1) enhance teacher professionalism and welfare; (2) upgrade the material; (3) upgrade the method; (4) upgrade equipment; and (5) upgrade learning motivation. Besides that, there are several strategies needed to enhance competitiveness: (1) defensive strategy; (2) survival strategy; (3) adaptive strategy; and (4) competitive oriented strategy. According to Gunawan (2015), the selection of the approach was influenced by the comprehension of supervisors about the theories, interpretation and experience involved. The supervisor must examine everything concerning a teacher or the teacher's characteristics. According to Zeegers and Barron (2012), there is a very personal and affective dimension to this. This dimension is suggested by stories of unpleasant supervisory experiences. Traditional approaches to supervision do not position students to have much influence in shaping the learning process. The supervisor may be enabled to facilitate learner centrality in the process.

Conclusion

The strengthening of learning supervision, based on school culture, has been carried out in all three kindergartens. Principals as supervisors in kindergartens have made plans that are very flexible regarding implementation. Supervision was carried out through class visits. Even though they have the same pattern, the three kindergartens have a distinctive style that is general and religious. Leadership and the ability of principals to carry out supervision greatly influences the progress of the school. Better supervision of learning by the principal will affect the progress of the school.

Table 1

Comparison of the learning supervision of three kindergartens

No	Aspects	Pembina I Kindergarten	Alfadholi Kindergarten	ABA 26 Kindergarten
1	Planning	Scheduled	Scheduled	Scheduled
2	Supervision material	Learning administration, learning program resources, multimedia methods and evaluation.	Learning administration, learning program resources, multimedia methods and evaluation.	Learning administration, learning program resources, multimedia methods and evaluation.
3	Implementation	By individual or group	By individual or group	By individual or group
4	Evaluation	APKG 1 APKG2 Follow-up improvements	APKG 1 APKG2 Follow-up improvements	APKG 1 APKG2 Follow-up improvements
5	School Culture	Religious, democratic, apologetic, grateful, involves asking for permission and involves asking for help.	Religious, democratic, apologetic, grateful, involves asking for permission and involves asking for help.	Religious, democratic, apologetic, grateful, involves asking for permission and involves asking for help.
6	Principle	Friendly, constructively open and collaborative.	Democratic, empowering, openly harmonious, collaborative and constructive.	Empowering, harmonious and collaborative concerning freedom.
7	Approach	Non-directive and Democratic.	Informal, non-directive and collaborative.	Non-directive and Humanist.
8	Technique	Individual	Individual and classic.	Individual



References

- Anshori, Imron, A., & Maisyaroh. (2017). *Pelaksanaan Supervisi Pembelajaran di Sekolah Dasar*. Malang: Universitas Negeri Malang.
- Alfonso, R. J. (1981). *Instructional Supervision: A Behavior System*. Boston: Allyn and Bacon Inc.
- Bogahalande, N., Ahamed, F., & Teng, M. E. (2019). Leadership Style and Innovativeness in the Plantation Sector: The Mediating Role of Organizational Culture. *International Journal on Innovation, Creativity, and Change*, 7(5), 50-70.
- Caruso, F. (2007). *Supervision in Early Childhood Education*. New York Columbia University. Teachers College Press.
- Donkoh, K. E., & Dwamena, E. O. (2014). Effects of Educational Supervision on Professional Development: Perception of Public Basic School Teachers at Wanneba Ghana. *British Journal of Education*, 2(6), 63-82.
- Garman, N. B. (1982). *The Clinical Approach to Supervision of Teaching*. Washington DC: ASCD.
- Garza, E. J. (2014). Leadership for Success Schools: Lesson from Effective Principals. *International Journal of Educational Management*, 28(7) 798-811. <https://doi.org/10.1108/IJEM-08-2013-0125>
- Glickman, C. D., Gordon, S. P., & Ross-Gordon, J. M. (2009). *Supervision and Instructional Leadership*. New York: Pearson.
- Gordon, S.P. (2019). Educational Supervision: Reflections on Its Past, Present, and Future. *Journal of Educational Supervision*, 2(2), 27-52. <https://doi.org/10.31045/jes.2.2.3>
- Gunawan, I. (2015). Mengembangkan Alternatif-alternatif Pendekatan dalam Pelaksanaan Supervisi Pembelajaran. *Manajemen Pendidikan*, 24(6), 467-482.
- Huang, T. C., & Hsiao, W. J. (2007). The Causal Relationship between Job Satisfaction and Organizational Commitment. *Social Behavior and Personality*, 35(9), 1265-1276. <https://doi.org/10.2224/sbp.2007.35.9.1265>
- Hubermans, & Miles. (2019). *Qualitatif Method*. New York: Prentice Hall.
- Kalule, L., & Bouchamma, Y. (2014). Teacher Supervision Practices and Characteristics of in School Supervisor in Uganda. *Educational Assessment Evaluation Acc*, 26, 51-72. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11092-013-9181-y>
- Knezovic, E., & Musrati, M. A. (2018). CPI Serves as a Reliable Self-Report to Measure the Creative Personality of Students with a Reliability Coefficient of 0.911. *International Journal on Innovation, Creativity, and Change*, 4(2), 51-72.
- Lisdayanti, A. B. A., & Santosa, A. B. (2019). The Influence of Guidance and Supervision on the Work Performance of Civil State Employees in the Office of the X Ministry Y Jakarta Indonesia. *International Journal on Innovation, Creativity, and Change*, 6(12), 1-23.
- Maisyaroh, Wiyono, B. B., Burhanuddin, & Rasyad, A. (2017). *The Relation of Educational Supervision and Teacher's Teaching Skills*. Proceeding COeMa. Advances in Economics, Business, and Management Research, Atlantis Press, 45, 300-303. <https://doi.org/10.2991/coema-17.2017.51>
- Maisyaroh. (2012). *Studi Multi Situs Implementasi Supervisi Kolaboratif dalam Pembelajaran di SMP dan MTs Unggulan Kota Malang*. Malang: Universitas Negeri Malang.



- Minter, M. K. (2011). Learner Centred (LCI) Vs Teacher Centered (TCI) Instruction: A Classroom Management Perspective. *American Journal Business Education*, 4(5), 55-66. <https://doi.org/10.19030/ajbe.v4i5.4225>
- Nurochmah. (2017). Peran Kepala Sekolah dalam Melakukan Kontrol Mutu Pendidikan. *Jurnal Tarbiyatuna*, 2(1), 148-180.
- Paul, A. K., & Anantharaman, R. N. (2003). Impact of People Management Practices on Organizational Performance: Analisis of Causal Model. *International Journal of Human Resource Management*, 14(7), 1246-1266. <https://doi.org/10.1080/0958519032000145648>
- Pramono. (2019). *Pengembangan Model Pembelajaran untuk Anak Usia Dini dengan Model Permainan CE2IG*. Surabaya: Universitas Negeri Surabaya.
- Prasojo, L. D., & Sudiyono. (2011). *Pembinaan Pendidikan*. Yogyakarta: Gava Media.
- Rahman, M. 2016. *Standarisasi dan Peranan Pengawas PAUD di Kabupaten Gorontalo*. Proceeding Konvensi Nasional Pendidikan Indonesia VIII 2016, Jakarta.
- Samawi, A., Wulandari, R., & Aisyah, N. E. (2016). *Pola Pembinaan Guru PAUD di Kota Malang*. Malang: Fakultas Ilmu Pendidikan Universitas Negeri Malang.
- Samawi. A. (2016). *Keberadaan Lembaga Pendidikan PAUD sebagai Organisasi Nonprofit*. Proceeding Konvensi Nasional Pendidikan Indonesia VIII 2016, Jakarta.
- Samawi, A., Wulandari, R. T., & Aisyah, E. N. (2016). Supervisi Budaya dalam Meningkatkan Implementasi Kurikulum 2013. *Jurnal Ilmu Pendidikan*, 22(2), 134-139.
- Samawi. A. (2017). *The Supervision of Learning Based Culture on Education Institutions Early Childhood*. CoEMA. Advances in Economics, Business and Management Research, volume 45, Atlantis Press.
- Sonhaji, A. (2019). *Multicultural Educational and Learning at School in Indonesia*. Proceeding. the 6th International Conference on Community Development in ASEAN 2019 on July 24-25, Brunei Darussalam.
- Stones, E. (1984). *Supervision in Teacher*. New York: Penguin. https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203472583_chapter_1
- Supriono, Imron, A., Arifin, I., & Kusmintardjo, (2018). *The Situational Behavior Orientation of Instructional Supervision: A Multiside Study*. Proceeding COeMa. Advances in Economics, Business, and Management Research, volume 45, Atlantis Press, 304-308.
- Susanto, E., Novitasari, Y., Yusuf, S., & Ilfiandra. (2018). Development of Creative Personality: Hypothetical Concept. *International Journal on Innovation, Creativity, and Change*, 4(2), 176-192.
- Wahyuni, S. (2015). *Peningkatan Nilai Strategis Jasa Layanan Lembaga Pendidikan Anak Usia Dini (Studi Multisitus pada Tiga Lembaga PAUD di Kota Malang)*. Malang: Universitas Negeri Malang.
- Wayne, & Miskel. C.G. (2008). *Educational Administration. Theory, Research, and Practice*. New York: Mc Graw Hill Companies Inc.
- Wiles, K., & Lovell, J. T. (1987). *Supervision for Better Schools*. New York: Prentice Hall, Inc.
- Wiyono, B. B. (2017). The Effect of Self-Evaluation on Principals Transformational Leadership, Teachers Work Motivation, Teamwork Effectiveness, and School Improvement.



International Journal of Innovation, Creativity and Change. www.ijicc.net
Volume 5, Issue 4, Special Edition: ICET Malang City, 2019

International Journal of Leadership in Education.

<https://doi.org/10.1080/13603124.2017.1318960>

Wiyono, B. B., Kusmintardjo, & Supriyanto, A. (2014). Grand Deign Model Pembinaan Profesional Guru Berbasis Determinan Kinerja Guru. *Jurnal Ilmu Pendidikan*, 20(2), 165-175.

Wiyono, B. B. (2009). Relasi Kepemimpinan Transformasional Kepala Sekolah dan Motivasi Kerja Guru. *Jurnal Ilmu Pendidikan*, 20(2), 165-175.

Zeegers, M., & Barron, D. (2012). Pedagogical Concerns in Doctoral Supervision: a Challenge for Pedagogy. *Quality Assurance in Education*, 20(1), 20-30.
<https://doi.org/10.1108/09684881211198211>