

Secret Service of the World: A Comparison of Three Intelligence Agencies - ISI, CIA and RAW

Dildar F Zebari^a, ^aDuhok Polytechnic University Legal Affairs Department,
Email: dildar.f@dpu.edu.krd

Secret service refers to a service which kept in secrecy. Secret services consist of many activities including protection of top officials of a country, finding out the thefts and criminal in the country and abroad. This paper attempts to study the secret services of the world, including three intelligence agencies. The structure of the article is divided into two sections. The first section deals with the definition of secret service; its kinds, elements, and how they are executed. The second section deals with world top three intelligence agencies discussing their backgrounds, structures, capabilities and services they are engaged in. The concluding part of the article is used to compare and contrast the secret services of the three intelligence agencies as well as matters related to them. The findings show that each intelligence agency is out of a war syndrome, well-structured. ISI has the power that can surpass the government, while the CIA and RAW are relatively in the control of the government. CIA is technologically well advance; ISI is least funded still competitive, and RAW is well managed. World's three top 10 intelligence agencies discussed in the paper are presented on five indicators, namely their background, objectives, structure, capabilities and examples of secret services. If we look to reason for initiating these agencies of all three countries is the issue of war. Pakistan created due to the 1947 war with India. The USA created due to the issue of Japan's attack, and India created due to its failure in war with China. However, the year of creation ISI and CIA is similar while India has created RAW after 20 years from them. Another similarity found among these three intelligence agencies are they get engaged with other world agencies and offer their services.

Keywords: *Secret Service, ISI, CIA and RAW*



Introduction

In today's technologically advanced and interdependent economic world, the significant of secret services increased ever before. Secret services are imperative for a country's establishment, its existence and its economic, social and political continuity in the world. They safeguard country's sovereignty, provide security and peaceful environment for citizens of a country to conduct their day to day activities and pursue their personal and collective goals confined with the laws of the land. They keep countries' secret and sensitive data secured and protected (Jérôme, 2006). In this paper, I attempt to study the secret services of world three intelligence agencies, whereby the structure of the article is divided into two sections. The first section deals with the definition of secret service; its kinds, elements and how they are executed while the second section deals with world top three intelligence agencies discussing their backgrounds, structures, capabilities and services they are engaged in. The concluding part of the article is used to compare and contrast the secret services of the three intelligence agencies as well as matters related to them. The study's analysis shows that each intelligence agency is out of war syndrome, well-structured. ISI has a power that can surpass the government, while the CIA and RAW are relatively in the control of the government. CIA is technologically well advance; ISI is least funded still competitive, and RAW is well managed.

Secret Service Explanation

Secret service as per wording here means a service which kept in secrecy. Secret services consist of a number of activities including protection of top officials of a country, finding out the thefts and criminal in the country and abroad, eliminating the threats potential to country's security, involving in other states' matters and destabilising them to attain own country's foreign policy and interests (Shawn, 2014). Personnel involved in secret services are known as agents, spies or undercover officers (Top 10 Best Intelligence Agencies in The World 2016).

Secret services are divided in terms of geography and nature of work. In terms of geography, there are two types. The first is involved in country's internal matters or domestic issues while the second is involved in country's foreign affairs or external issues. As per the nature of the work, it is uncountable. Some are engaged in criminal issues; some are engaged in economic issues; some are engaged in political issues etc. (Jérôme, 2006). Intelligence agencies studied in this article belong to external issues of a country, and they usually are engaged in covert operations.

The essential elements of secret services are jurisdiction, secrecy, timely, accurately, predictive and professionalism (Jérôme, 2006). Jurisdiction intends to explain the government



controls their operations and activities; thus, they are legal. Otherwise, any such activity conducted out of government awareness will be considered conspiracy or spy work against the government, and it can lead to the death penalty. The second element is the secrecy that is the backbone of secret services without it no goal of secret services will be achieved, and the third and fourth elements are timely and accurately which indicate that service must be executed on time. As planned, else it can cause immensely. The last element is professionalism which means that the work should be carried in a way; no one can think of the person he/she is a spy or agent of any government.

Fundamentally, secret services are executed by intelligence agencies created by the government, but due to the expansion of privatisation in the current world, now private organisations are also involved as secret service providers. However, they are registered and working as per country's laws and regulations as well they are more to matters concerned to business tycoon, politicians and general people of the country.

Intelligence Agencies

In simple term, the intelligence agency is a government body that works for the security and the stability of a country (Aslam, 2016). It possesses numerous overt and covert sources to collect secret information and owns an extraordinary ability to interpret them timely and accurately. Generally, intelligence agencies are involved in collecting information related to non-state terrorism, the plot of mass annihilation, systematised delinquency, weapons, drug trafficking and all which has a potential threat to the security of a country (Top 10 Best Intelligence Agencies in the World 2016).

First, Pakistan's Intelligence Agency ISI'S Background

ISI (Inter-Service Intelligence) is Pakistan's leading armed functioned intelligence agency (Pawar, 2014). It is the first line of Pakistan's defence as mentioned by Pervez Musharraf back in 2007 (Ahmad, 2008). ISI is among top ten best intelligence agencies of the world. According to American Crime News, it is world's finest and strongest intelligence agency. It is one of the top three intelligence agencies of Pakistan, including the Intelligence Bureau (IB) and Military Intelligence (MI). It was founded in 1948 immediately after 1947 Indo-Pak war, where few named it as first Kashmir war. It was to fortify the performance of Military Intelligence of Pakistan (Ahmad, 2008). It is located at *Shahrah-e-Soharwardi* in Islamabad. ISI is credited immensely in the establishment of Pakistan and its continuity. In simple word, it is the one that runs the country. Its policies are made in a way that no institution is aware of its processes except the Army (Ahmad, 2008).



Objectives

As per normal understanding of intelligence agencies, ISI also functions to stabilise Pakistan and provide security to its people (Shaun, 2013). However, it focuses on counter-terrorism, scrutiny and counter-intelligence. It also offers its service to other intelligence agencies over the world (10 Best Intelligence Agencies in the World, 2016). It was the rule of Mohammad Ayub Khan, who asked ISI to monitor politician of opposite parties especially who stayed in East Pakistan which is current Bangladesh. During the era of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto, ISI was requested to assemble information in Baluchistan, whoever assisted the separatist group there (Ahmad, 2008). Apart from the mentioned objectives, ISI also offers their help to the CIA to crackdown Al-Qaeda operatives (Ahmad, 2008).

Structure

ISI is an independent unit functions along with Pakistan's two intelligence agencies: The Intelligence Bureau and Military Intelligence. Although, Pakistan is having all together five intelligence services, including prescribed three and remaining two are Naval Intelligence and Air Intelligence (Pawar, 2014). With the recommendation of Chief of Army Staff, it reports to Prime Minister. ISI management is headed by a General Director who deals with domestic and counter-insurgency issues. There are three Deputy Directors who work under General Director and follow three different fields. One deals with counter-intelligence and political issues in Pakistan known as Internal Wing. Second is External Wing, which deals with external issues and the third is Analysis and Foreign Relations Wing which deals with decoding the matters as well create better relations with other intelligence agencies (Grare, 2009).

Capability

No exact data is explaining the strength and capability of ISI as well as other intelligence agencies discussed in this paper is available. Based on the estimation, the working people in ISI are 25,000 and who provide secret information and play crucial roles; their number is 30,000 (Ahmad, 2008). It is observed that their personnel very careful of camera operators. It is a praiseworthy matter for ISI is that it is regarded as the least funded intelligence agency among world top-ranking intelligence agencies (10 Best Intelligence Agencies in the World, 2016). It is considered world's best-ordered intelligence agencies over the world (Pawar, 2014).



Examples of Secret Services

The best articulated secret services mentioned about ISI, which is the greatest achievement, in fact, is defeating the Soviet armies of Russia (Ahmad, 2008). KGB the super technologically advanced intelligence agency of Soviets was unable to track ISI at all (10 Best Intelligence Agencies in the World, 2016). When the CIA saw an opportunity to defeat its counterpart using other agencies, showed her interest to ISI to help rebels of Afghanistan against USSR. Being smart, ISI placed several conditions beneficial to ISI and its interests such as asking CIA to provide weapons and money alone and leaving training to them only as well it will retain control on rebels after the mission (Shaun, 2013). It is equally important and achievement for ISI that it was capable of guarding Pakistan's nuclear weapons and did not allow India to be a final supreme state of South Asia by their destabilising policy for India (Ahmad, 2008). For many terrorist activities taken place in India, ISI is counted responsible for it, including the 2001 Parliament attack, 2008 Mumbai attack (Oakley & Gady, 2009).

Similarly, attack in Afghanistan on the Indian Embassy is seen caused by ISI as well as they are using the Taliban for their benefits (Oakley & Gady, 2009). It is not mere accusations as a claim by few because British and American governments have strong evidence, but due to their interests, they are not bringing forward to them (Pawar, 2014). The number of terrorist groups, i.e. *Lashkar-e-Tayyeba* (LeT) and *Hizbul Mujahideen* (HuM) operating in India is considered the mastermind of ISI (Pawar, 2014). ISI is also accused of protecting Abdul Qadeer Khan, who is alleged of sharing nuclear information to Iran, Libya and North Korea (Allbritton & Hosenball, 2011).

However, it is one of it continues failure is a suicide bombing in Pakistan which is a constant happening. There no month passes without having suicide bombing there. It means in a way that ISI is not able to overcome this issue. Thousands of people have died in suicide bombing as well some particular shooting happened to country's leaders like Benazir Bhutto (Allbritton & Hosenball, 2011).

Second, the USA Intelligence Agency CIA'S Background

CIA (Central Intelligence Agency) in the US most prominent and durable intelligence agency works day and night to keep the US dominant continued over the world (The Central Intelligence Agency (CIA), 2020). It is one of top four intelligence agencies of US including the National Security Agency (NSA), Defense Intelligence Agency (DIA) and Federal Bureau of Investigation (FBI). It is reported the best intelligence agency of the world due to its established wide range of connectivity across the globe (Top 10 Best Intelligence Agencies in the World 2016). CIA was established back on 18th September 1947 to avoid



mistakes occurred during the Pearl Harbor intelligence failure related to Japan attack (The Central Intelligence Agency, 2016) as well as the US wanted to secure itself from Soviet Union (Donald, 2020). It is located in Fairfax, Virginia, a couple of miles away in the West of Washington, DC (The Central Intelligence Agency, 2016).

Objectives

The CIA's foremost objective is collecting information that could influence US policy or cause any threat to its existence from across the globe (Donald, 2020). Its distinguishing feature is it is the only agency which engages in covert operations on the appeal of President of the US. It also guides policymakers based on their accumulated secret information around the world (An Overview of the United States Intelligence Community for the 111th Congress, 2009).

Structure

The CIA works under the US Intelligence Community, where it reports directly to its Directory and sparing no time to the President and the Cabinet of US (Top 10 Best Intelligence Agencies in the World, 2016). The CIA has its four important branches namely the Directorate of Operations (DO), the Directorate of Intelligence (DI), the Directorate of Administration (DA), and the Directorate of Science and Technology (DS&T). Every single department mentioned here has Deputy Director, and each has specific duties to be carried out (The Central Intelligence Agency, 2016).

Capabilities

CIA has its website explaining its vision, mission and challenges, etc., but it does mention about its strength once again in terms of statistics. It is found out from another source that the CIA has about 16,500 employees, and its annual budget is nearly \$750,000,000 (Agee, 1975). It is a very silent working agency whose strength is unknown to the people as it is professed by the President of Clinton once upon a time. It is also noticed that it is the technologically most advanced agency and highly supported by the United State government (Smith, 2003).

Examples of Secret Services

There is a number of examples to mention how the CIA is working secretly to achieve US national interests. Based on the book 'Inside the Company: CIA Diary (1975)', CIA has been plotting to overthrow numerous governments around the world including Iran, Sudan, Syria, Ecuador, Guyana, Zaire etc. In Greece, it brought regime good for US interest. It was CIA which worked behind Indonesia's 1965 coup (Agee, 1975). The celebrated CIA achievement



is PBSUCCESS Operation, which helped rebels of Guatemala to overthrow their democratically elected president and the second operation is the assassination of Osama Bin Laden which has gained worldwide popularity to the US because he was dangerous for any country (Agee, 1975). It is CIA which created the Taliban at first and supported them to fight with Russian to defeat growing communism as mentioned earlier (The Central Intelligence Agency, 2016).

However, there are failure incidents of CIA as well as 1994's spy scandal carried by Aldrich Ames to the Soviet Union, which led to the execution of many CIA agents. It was also defeated very badly during its agent operation against Cuba and East Germany (FBI, 2020). 2001, 9/11 is another big tragedy CIA has faced (Jeffrey, 2008).

Third, India's Intelligence Agency RAW'S Background

RAW (Research and Analysis Wing) is India's specialised foreign intelligence agency. It is one of the best, systematic and action-oriented agency (Top 10 Best Intelligence Agencies in The World, 2016). It is a realisation of having more competitive and advanced intelligence agency, examining the end of the 1962 India-China war and the 1965 India-Pakistan war (Bajoria, 2008). Thus, on 21st September 1968, it was created under the directorship of Rameshwar Nath Kao, headquartered in New Delhi (Top 10 Best Intelligence Agencies in The World, 2016).

Objectives

The prime objective of RAW is again what is mentioned about others is finding and analysing the secret information obtained from varied states, intelligence, corporations and personnel around the world (Pawar, 2014). It also engages in counter-terrorism and covert operations. It focuses on monitoring its two neighbours China and Pakistan activities and movements (Singh, 2007). It is also mentioned that RAW was created to provoke a sense of independence of Bangladesh from Pakistan (Bajoria, 2008). It works to limit the military supply to Pakistan as well as it monitors all countries in the world, which could create any threat to India (Bajoria, 2008).

Structure

The structure of RAW is explained that its head is designated with "Secretary" who only reports to Prime Minister of India (Top 10 Best Intelligence Agencies in The World, 2016). Under the head of RAW, there is Additional Secretary which is in charge of the Office of Special Operations and intelligence bureau. Intelligence is consisting of many Joint Secretaries who monitor different regions and countries based on their specified jobs. As per



RAW objectives, it has special secretariat for China and Pakistan (Nandy, 2016).

Capabilities

During this research, I came to know RAW does not have even its websites; this indicates secrecy which it has. In my personal view, it is part of a strategy which does not allow its counterparts to know how capable it is. Therefore, it was difficult to find, how many personnel are involved in this agency and what kind of weapons or skills they are good in. It is found that few RAW personnel are trained with CIA and Mossad in the USA and Israel respectively. It is also mentioned that for a long time British. The USA did not allow RAW to engage in covert actions without bringing any reason but seems RAW is good in it because as it is reported that to topple General HM Ershad in Bangladesh, RAW has played a significant and crucial role by bringing two pro-democracy women Sheikh Hasina and Khaleda Zia, and it was a successful job (Nandy, 2016). According to a source, which advocates that in 2000 RAW consisted of eight to ten thousand agents with \$145 million budget (Bajoria, 2008).

Examples of Secret Services

Some of the RAW successful conducted services are role played in the creation of Bangladesh, in the year 1971 (Isha, 2007), utilising the time; it helped Indian government to examine its bombs (Gupta, 2016). Some writer also mentioned that India's good friendship with Afghanistan and creating a gap between her and Pakistan is due to the active role played by RAW. It is mentioned by Khan that RAW is very smartly controlling all neighbours (Gupta, 2016). It is noted that RAW interferes in its neighbours' businesses (Bajoria, 2008). It is reported that it is India's RAW which played a role to create anxiety in Baluchistan and urging them to seek freedom from Pakistan (Ahmad, 2008). However, RAW is also unable to control the terrorist activities on Indian soil.

Conclusion

World's three top 10 intelligence agencies discussed above are presented on five indicators, namely their background, objectives, structure, capabilities and examples of secret services. If we look to reason for initiating these agencies of all three countries is the issue of war. Pakistan created due to the 1947 war with India. The USA created due to the issue of Japan's attack, and India created due to its failure in war with China. However, the year of creation ISI and CIA is similar while India has created RAW after 20 years from them. Another similarity found among these three intelligence agencies are they get engaged with other world agencies and offer their services. In terms of objectives, all three are committed to country's security. However, ISI and RAW look they are chasing each other, unlike CIA which monitor all countries equally. However, the case of ISI and RAW has justified reason



for doing so as well because they are neighbours and have a long-standing dispute of Kashmir that it belongs to India or Pakistan.

In terms of structure, all three intelligence agencies have well-distributed tasks and a sense of cooperation among them. They differ in reporting, ISI reports to Prime Minister with the recommendation of Army Chief. In contrast, RAW reports to PM directly and CIA need to report to the President of America as well as to Congress. It is also noted that the division of work in the CIA is more compared to the rest two.

In terms of capabilities, the majority of the sources researcher has gone through ranked ISI as the most advanced and capable agency. However, the common phenomena found among all three is they all not mentioning their actual power, and this is logical to put the enemy in the dark. Assuming America wants to keep her supremacy over the world, thus it seems the number of personnel engaged with the CIA will be much larger than the rest of the two as well its budget capacity. One source mentioned that ISI is the least funded agency which is good and it shows the talent and skill of ISI that having less money, still it is able to count her name in world's top 10 best intelligent agencies. In terms of examples of secret services carried by each agency are exemplifying how each agency efficiently working to achieve their country's interests. However, each agency is suffering from terrorist activities.



REFERENCES

- Agee, P. (1975). *Inside the company: CIA Diary*. George Braziller, Inc.
- Ahmad, I. (2008). *The Pakistan inter-services intelligence: A profile*. 'Institute of South Asian Studies'.
- Allbritton, C. and Hosenball, M. (2011). *Why the US mistrusts Pakistan's powerful spy agency*. 'Reuters' 1.
- Aslam, H. (2016). *What are the top 10 strongest secret agencies in the world*. Available at '<http://www.strongestinworld.com>' by 05th March, 2020
- Bajoria, J. (2008). '*RAW: India's external intelligence agency*'. 'Council of Foreign Relations'.
- Donald, P. S. (2020). *Origins of CIA's Analysis of the Soviet Union*, Available at '<https://www.cia.gov/library/center-for-the-study-of-intelligence/csi-publications/books-and-monographs/watching-the-bear-essays-on-cias-analysis-of-the-soviet-union/article01.html>' by 07th March, 2020.
- FBI, (2020). Available at '<https://www.fbi.gov/history/famous-cases/aldrich-ames>' by 07th March, 2020.
- Grare, F. (2009). *Reforming the intelligence agencies in Pakistan's transitional democracy*. 'Carnegie Endowment for International Peace'.
- Gupta, A. (2016). *10 most powerful intelligence agencies around the world*. Available at '<http://www.storypick.com>' by 03rd March, 2020.
- Isha, K. (2007). *RAW: An instrument of Indian imperialism*. Available at '<http://www.countercurrents.org>' by 04th March, 2020.
- Jeffrey, R. (2003). *Bounding the Global War on Terrorism*, Strategic Studies Institute, JR., W. THOMAS SMITH, '*Encyclopedia of the Central 2008US Army War College, Intelligence Agency*' Available at '<http://www.factsonfile.com>', by 06th March, 2020
- Jérôme, M. (2006). '*Understanding Intelligence Services*' Available at '<https://www.saferworld.org.uk/resources/publications/239-understanding-intelligence-services>' by 06th March, 2020



- Nandy, C. (2016). '*India's covert action capabilities stymied by CIA and MI6 Pressure*' 'www.thequint.com'.
- Oakley, R.B.; and Gady, F.-S. (2009). 'Radicalization by Choice: ISI and the Pakistani Army' 'Institute for National Strategic Studies, National Defense University, USA'.
- Pawar, B.S. (2014). '*Demystifying the ISI*', 'Scholar Warrior' 51.
- Shaun, G. (2013) '*The ISI and the War on Terrorism*' 'Studies in Conflict & Terrorism' 1013.
- Shawn, R. (2014). '*The US Secret Service: History and Missions*' 'Congressional Research Service'.
- Singh, V.K. M. (2007). '*India's external intelligence: Secrets of research and analysis wing raw*' 'Manas Publications'.
- The Central Intelligence Agency (CIA), (2020). Available at <https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/resources/cia-at-a-glance/index.html> by 07th March, 2020.