

Evaluation of Entrepreneurship Education in Islamic Religious Higher Education Institutions in Indonesia

Wahidmurni^a, ^aUniversitas Islam Negeri Maulana Malik Ibrahim Malang, Indonesia, Email: wahidmurni@pips.uin-malang.ac.id

This study aims to evaluate the implementation of the entrepreneurship learning process from the aspects of planning, implementation and evaluation in five study programs in four higher education institutions. It employs the evaluation method by using input, output/performance and impact/outcome assessment. Data is collected through assessment by experts to assess the quality of the syllabus content, assessment by participants – students and lecturers – by using online questionnaires (Google form), and interviews with lecturers. Data is analysed by comparing the existing syllabus components with the syllabus preparation criteria of the Directorate of Islamic Higher Education, calculating the average student response to the learning performance, and interpreting the open questionnaire of lecturers, as well as examining the patterns of the interview results. The results suggest that the syllabus is not in line with the learning achievement criteria. The implementation of all components in entrepreneurship learning is perceived positively by students. The evaluation result reveals that the cognitive domain assessment instrument is dominantly used, while the attitude and skill domain is not maximally implemented. Entrepreneurship education curriculum design needs to be standardised, so that the quality of the entrepreneurship learning process can be well-measured.

Keywords: *Entrepreneurship, Entrepreneurship Education, Entrepreneurship Syllabus, Entrepreneurship Learning Evaluation, Entrepreneurship Education in higher education.*

Introduction

Entrepreneurship is fundamentally essential to reduce unemployment in various countries. To that end, the country has a very high expectation of educational institutions to contribute to generating future entrepreneurs. Most universities all over the world provide entrepreneurship courses in various study programs. A large number of countries have been aware of the

prominence of the internationalisation of entrepreneurship education within the country. The United Nations Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) in the Inter-Regional Seminar conducted in Thailand 2008 stressed the importance of entrepreneurship education which aims to equip students with the ability to take initiative, to be responsible, to take risks, to be creative and innovative, and to think outside the box. The recommendation aims to anticipate and respond to the massive changes in society (UNESCO, 2008).

The effectiveness of entrepreneurship education and training programs for increasing students' interest in entrepreneurship is suggested by Ghadas et al. (2014: 90). The study proves that 81% of students are interested, and they want to become entrepreneurs after graduation. The biggest reason to choose entrepreneurship as a prospective career is the potential to earn more income and profits. Frimpong (2014) in his study shows that entrepreneurship education has a positive impact on students' intention to form a partnership effort after they graduate. It shows a positive relationship between entrepreneurship education and subsequent entrepreneurial activities (Raposo and do Paço, 2011). Entrepreneurship education is an important variable with a direct and significant effect on student entrepreneurial intentions (Carda et al., 2016). The fact that many students are successful in the entrepreneurship program encouraged various universities in the United States to develop curriculums on entrepreneurship as a field of study for undergraduate education. McClure's study (2015: 435) suggests four reasons why universities in America develop entrepreneurship programs: (1) rapid economic change, (2) opportunities and demands, (3) interest in university funding, and (4) intention to adopt the success of another university.

The curriculum is an important component for the establishment of education and learning programs. It guides academics upon the implementation of learning activities to achieve certain educational goals. Ornstein and Hunkins (in Khan & Law 2015) suggest that "curriculum development explains the curriculum planning, implementation, and evaluation, as well as the involved parties, processes, and procedures." It implies that the curriculum is essential for the implementation of educational programs to maximise the use of educational resources to reach the educational goals. Therefore, the approach to developing the curriculum must cover design, implementation and assessment.

Khan & Law (2015) state that curriculum development needs to use an integrative approach to achieve the ideals and goals of higher educational institutions even if the implication and the social changes are dynamic and too fast. It is vital to know the culture of the higher institution due to the variety of student learning and teaching styles. To that end, the culture in the university is essential for curriculum development. Welsh & Drăguşin (2011) conclude that there is no consensus on what and how to teach entrepreneurship best, but that content and pedagogics should target three main characteristics of an entrepreneur and innovator: knowledge, skills and attitudes. Shai and Enu (cited in Winarno et al. 2019) come with three

components from the entrepreneurship education curriculum category, considered comprehensive enough to equip the school system the output with the skills and capacities needed in the future: personal development, business development and entrepreneurship-skill development. In terms of personal development, the responsibility for personal development lies with the entire staff of the institution because they are the model in promoting the character of entrepreneurship (Lickona, 2001).

A study by Aldianto et al. (2018) finds that the characteristics of the Entrepreneurship Education program in Indonesia go towards three mapping points: (1) inputs, related to institutional arrangements, audiences, types and objectives, (2) processes, related to content, teaching and training methods, and (3) output, related to indicators of success, weaknesses and advantages to direct students in the process of finding new ideas and innovations. In terms of content, five units are subject to study in all universities: (1) General management, (2) Entrepreneurship, (3) Theoretical and professional dimensions, (4) Practical aspect of managing new or small businesses, (5) Occasional lack of consensus on content which is based on students' needs.

Entrepreneurship has been the target of attitudes and values, knowledge and skills and formulated to be the goal of every graduate of the Islamic Religious Higher Education institutions (IRHE) in Indonesia (Kementerian Agama Republik Indonesia, 2018). Entrepreneurship learning equips students with entrepreneurship knowledge, attitudes and skills. Thus, they have a strong motivation to be entrepreneurs. They focus not only on careers in accordance to their courses, but also entrepreneurship as an alternative career.

Methods

The current study aims to describe the conditions in learning practices in entrepreneurship education among the IRHEs in Indonesia. This includes the learning plan, implementation and assessment. The reviews are performed in four selected IRHEs: IRHE in Malang (IRHE 1), IRHE in Kudus (IRHE 2), IRHE in Mataram (IRHE 3), and IRHE in Tulungagung (IRHE 4). Data was collected in five study programs (SP): Social Science Education (SP 1), Islamic Laws (SP 2), Syariah Economics (SP 3), Social Science Education (SP 4), and Elementary School Teacher Education (SP 5). Table 1 provides the details of the information of the IRHE and SP.

Table 1: Research Location Profile

Case Study	Description
IRHE 1 SP 1	The Study Program aims to create future educators of social sciences in high schools. The entrepreneurship course offered is mandatory to equip the graduates with entrepreneurship skills as an alternative for their future career.
IRHE 1 SP 2	The Study Program aims to develop graduates of Islamic Law and to create future judges. The entrepreneurship course offered is mandatory, so the graduates are able to develop their creativity upon preaching with various media.
IRHE 2 SP 3	The Study Program is highly responsive in developing sciences related to Sharia Banks. The graduates are supposed to be involved in growing Sharia Banks in Indonesia. It initiates the formation of a business incubator unit in higher education to develop entrepreneurship among students.
IRHE 3 SP 4	The Study Program aims to create future educators for social sciences, especially economics. Entrepreneurship offered is mandatory to promote entrepreneurship skills in order that the graduates become businessmen.
IRHE 4 SP 5	The Study Program aims to create future educators in elementary schools. The entrepreneurship course offered is mandatory to equip the graduates with entrepreneurship skills so that they become entrepreneurs.

An evaluation method using input, process/performance and output/impact assessment employed in the current study refers to that of the Powell theory (2006). Input measurement is applied to review the course syllabus, output/performance measurement to review the students' satisfaction upon the learning process, and output/impact measurement to review the result which covers entrepreneurship attitude, knowledge and skills. Data is collected by performing an assessment on the quality of the syllabus component, online questionnaires for students and lecturers, and interviews with some lecturers. The questionnaire points are developed by adopting the standardised questionnaire by the Ministry of Research, Technology, and Higher Education of the Republic of Indonesia in assessing the performance of the teacher candidates in the teacher education program in 2018.

The data is analysed and adjusted to the type of performed measurement. The analysis on the syllabus content formulation is done by comparing the existing syllabus component formulations with the syllabus preparation criteria from the Directorate of Islamic Higher Education as presented in Table 2, which was previously validated by two entrepreneurship education experts from Universitas Pendidikan Ganesha, Bali and Universitas Negeri Malang. Students' responses on learning performance are analysed by examining the averages, then compared with the assessment criteria table by the Directorate of Islamic Religious Higher Education as presented in Table 3. Besides, another analysis on the responses of the open questionnaire and interview to the lecturers is performed to support and validate the result. The

analysis of the learning assessment refers to the average response of students related to the acquisition of learning outcomes covering the entrepreneurship attitude, knowledge and skills.

Table 2: The Criteria for Syllabus Development in Undergraduate Education

Learning Objective (cited in the Graduate Learning Objective/CPL)	Expected Learning Outcome	Study Focus	Learning Method	Learning Assessment
Attitude: Internalising the motivation of independence, struggle, entrepreneurship	To receive and apply the entrepreneurship attitude and values	Attitude Entrepreneurship success	Group discussion, simulation, case study, collaborative learning, cooperative learning, project-based learning, problem-based learning, or other learning methods -the combined ones.	Observation, self-assessment, peer-assessment.
General Skills: Able to work in a team, perform a creative skill, innovative skill, critical thinking, and problem-solving skill upon science development and task implementation in the workplace	To be able to collaborate, to think critically and creatively, to innovate, to solve problems, and to communicate well	Practice the character of a successful entrepreneur		Observation, self-assessment, peer-assessment.
Specific Skills: Able to create a reliable business plan which can be followed up and applied in the real business development	To organise a business plan;	Field-work practice, business festival		Work assessment: practicum/ practice/ simulation/ field practice
Knowledge: Mastering the theory of entrepreneurship in the framework of creative and innovative science development	To know, to understand, to apply, to analyse. To evaluate and to create	Entrepreneurship theory and the basics of business		Written and spoken test

Table 3: The Evaluation Criteria of the Students' Response on the Learning Performance

Interval Score	Interval Converted Score (100 %)	Appreciation
0.00 – 1,99	0.00 – 49.99	Fail/Very Low
2.00 – 2.75	50.00 – 68.99	Fair/Low
2.76 – 3.00	69.00 – 75.24	Good/Medium
3.01 – 3.50	75.25 – 87.74	Very good/High
3.51 – 4.00	87.75 – 100.00	Excellent/Very High

The results of the comparison with the criteria are then drawn into a conclusion from the appreciation of every evaluated aspect.

There will be two research questions answered in this research:

1. To what extent has the syllabus for entrepreneurship studies of the five study programs fulfilled the criteria set by the Directorate of Islamic Religious Higher Education?
2. What are the levels of student satisfaction on entrepreneurship study programs?

Results and Discussion

The first part answers research question 1:

1. To what extent has the syllabus for entrepreneurship studies of the five study programs fulfilled the criteria set by the Directorate of Islamic Religious Higher Education?

The Evaluation of the Entrepreneurship Learning Plan

The formulation of various aspects of the curriculum in the syllabus: the formulation of learning objectives, expected basic competencies (learning outcomes), the materials, learning methods, and learning assessments, from five study programs (SP) is presented in Table 4.

Table 4: Curriculum Components in the Syllabus/Learning Plan for One Semester

Case Study	Component		
	Learning Objective	Basic Competence and Topic of the Study	Learning Method and Assessment
SP 1	Highly motivated and skilled to be a successful entrepreneur	<p>Describing the essence of entrepreneurship.</p> <p>Analysing the importance of entrepreneurship education, motivation, attitude, and skill.</p> <p>Analysing various concept and theory of entrepreneur and entrepreneurship.</p> <p>Identifying the steps to take through SWOT analysis.</p> <p>Creating a business plan.</p> <p>Analysing entrepreneurship activities in Islam.</p> <p>Analysing the characters and marketing strategy of micro and macro business.</p> <p>Understanding the role of business and dynamic of the national economy, and preparing to be an entrepreneur.</p>	<p>Learning Method:</p> <p>Lecture</p> <p>Discussion/</p> <p>Presentation</p> <p>Question and Answer</p> <p>Assignment</p> <p>Assessment Method:</p> <p>Written test</p> <p>Spoken test</p> <p>Presentation</p> <p>Assignment</p>
SP 2	Understanding and possessing an entrepreneurship passion in socioeconomic life which leads to a great profession as an expert in Islamic law and also individual among society.	<p>Understanding the process of entrepreneurship transformation and dream of success.</p> <p>Understanding the process of creative and innovative thinking in building a business.</p> <p>Understanding the attitude and behaviour of a successful entrepreneur.</p> <p>Understanding various kinds of business.</p> <p>Understanding the way event organiser works.</p> <p>Creating a great business plan.</p> <p>Understanding legal aspects related to a business in Indonesia.</p> <p>Understanding product and service marketing.</p> <p>Understanding financial management and administration.</p> <p>Understanding the business development strategy and building a business network.</p> <p>Building and developing an effective business team.</p> <p>Understanding the franchise business.</p> <p>Analysing the success story of a business owner who starts a business from zero.</p> <p>Conducting sharia product festival.</p>	<p>Learning Method:</p> <p>Lecture</p> <p>Discussion/</p> <p>Presentation</p> <p>Question and Answer</p> <p>Assignment</p> <p>Assessment Method:</p> <p>Written test</p> <p>Presentation</p> <p>Assignment</p>
SP 3	Providing the basic knowledge of entrepreneurship,	<p>Explaining the concept of entrepreneurship</p> <p>Explaining marketing management and personal selling</p> <p>Business planning and capital</p>	<p>Learning Method:</p> <p>Lecture</p> <p>Discussion/</p> <p>Presentation</p>

	finding business ideas and ways to run a business	Explaining micro business in Indonesia Choosing a business location Choosing a business entity Changing data and building a new business Creating product planning, brand and distribution strategy.	Assignment Small project Assessment Method: Written test Presentation Assignment
SP 4	Building an entrepreneurship spirit/soul and character, understanding the concept of entrepreneurship, and training entrepreneurship skills	Motivated to reach the goal, able to work in team upon building the business. Explaining entrepreneurship concept. Explaining the entrepreneurship opportunity. Identifying a prospective business opportunity. Analysing a new business opportunity. Creating a business plan. Creating a brand in a business plan. Creating a marketing plan. Analysing business with SWOT analysis. Explaining the concept of risk. Identifying the potential risk once starting a business. Understanding the ethic and social responsibility of a business. Understanding leadership in running a business. Creating a financial plan. Creating a business festival.	Learning Method: Lecture Discussion/ Presentation Assignment Assessment Method: Written test Presentation Assignment
SP 5	Understanding the definition of entrepreneurship and other related things Applying the concept of entrepreneurship, strategy and business ethics in Islam Applying the concept and strategy of entrepreneurship in daily life	Understanding the meaning of entrepreneurship. Understanding entrepreneurship and its purpose in Islam. Understanding the steps to be an entrepreneur . Understanding the character of an entrepreneur. Understanding the strategy of finding a business opportunity. Understanding the kinds of business. Creating a business plan. Understanding business ethic. Understanding the responsibility of a company to society. Understanding the ways to be a successful entrepreneur. Understanding the ways to run a small business. Creating a business feasibility study. Displaying work or business products in any entrepreneurial exhibition activities.	Learning Method: Lecture Discussion/ Presentation Assignment Assessment Method: Written test Presentation Assignment

The analysis of the course syllabus using syllabus arrangement guide for undergraduates as presented in Table 2, and the result is provided in the following Table 5.

Table 5: The Result of the Assessment Analysis on Syllabus Components of Entrepreneurship Course

Component	SP 1	SP 2	SP 3	SP 4	SP 5
Learning Objective	It contains attitudes and skills in general. The specific formulation in particular knowledge and skills is not found.	It contains attitudes, knowledge, and skills in general. Specific points are not explained.	It contains the formula of knowledge, yet the attitudes and skills are not provided.	It contains attitudes, knowledge, and skills in general, yet they are not specifically explained.	It contains the formula of particular knowledge and skills, yet that of the attitudes and skills is not provided.
The expected skill	The aspect of knowledge is adequate and formulated in detail. Specific skill is provided. Some formula of an entrepreneurship character is implied in the aspect of knowledge	The aspect of knowledge is adequate and formulated in detail. Specific skill is provided. Some formula of an entrepreneurship character is implied in the aspect of knowledge	The aspect of knowledge is adequate and formulated in detail. Specific skill is provided. Some formula of an entrepreneurship character is implied in the aspect of knowledge	The aspect of knowledge, skill, and attitude is adequate and formulated in detail. Specific skill is provided.	The aspect of knowledge is adequate and formulated in detail. Specific skill is provided. Some formula of an entrepreneurship character is implied in the aspect of knowledge
Study Focus	Knowledge: contains a complete entrepreneurship theory and basics of business. Skill: Business plan	Knowledge: contains a complete entrepreneurship theory and basics of business. Skill: Business plan	Knowledge: contains a complete entrepreneurship theory and basics of business. Skill: Business plan	Knowledge: contains a complete entrepreneurship theory and basics of business. Skill: Business Plan	Knowledge: contains a complete entrepreneurship theory and basics of business. Skill: Business plan

Learning Method	Appropriate and diverse. It applies various learning methods, yet it does not employ simulation	Appropriate and diverse. It applies various learning methods, yet it does not employ simulation	Appropriate and diverse. It applies various learning methods, yet it does not employ simulation	Appropriate and diverse. It applies various learning methods, yet it does not employ simulation	Appropriate and diverse. It applies various learning methods, yet it does not employ simulation
Learning Assessment	Attitude: Skill is found, but it is not diverse Knowledge: It is found and appropriate	Attitude: Skill is found, but it is not diverse Knowledge: It is found and appropriate	Attitude: Skill is found, but it is not diverse Knowledge: It is found and appropriate	Attitude: Skill is found, but it is not diverse Knowledge: It is found and appropriate	Attitude: Skill is found, but it is not diverse Knowledge: It is found and appropriate

The formulation of the learning objectives across the study programs is diverse and incomplete. The formula of every aspect, which is supposed to be provided, is not completely and specifically organised. According to Sulastri et al. (2017), such variety is also found in the state universities. They suggest that the materials and methods of learning entrepreneurship in various universities within the Ministry of Research and Higher Education vary, they even vary among study programs, faculties and universities.

The formulation of the basic standard of competence for the 'attitude' domain shows that all the study programs cannot even undertake the task of developing good learning objectives. It is a backlash, suggesting that the idea of a syllabus formulation guide by the Directorate of Islamic Religious Higher Education is a futile effort. It may however be possible that it comes about because the attainment of attitudes may occur as a result of the learning methods selection and may not point to ignorance on the part of the developers.

Aspects of the final ability expected for specific skills have been well formulated. It provides adequate skill development leading to the creation of a business plan for all the study programs. It goes in line with the study of Arasti et al. (2012) which concludes that a business plan is the main study in entrepreneurship. The European Commission, DG Enterprise and Industry (2012) states that creating a business plan is a difficult entrepreneurship skill. Thus, the ability to create a business plan is a certain skill which should be studied in an entrepreneurship class. The knowledge aspect or the expected final competence for general skills, such as collaboration ability, critical and creative thinking, and good communication is not however, formulated in detail by all the study programs.

Aspects of the final capabilities expected in the realm of knowledge have been formulated adequately and in detail. Verbs of the second-level cognitive domain in Bloom's taxonomy appear to be very dominating. Verbs reflect on items that encourage higher level thinking activity, like the characteristic of the level of thinking of an entrepreneur who is always looking for alternatives as a form of analytical thinking. In Bloom's taxonomy, analysis is the fourth level of thinking and where the initial level of thinking becomes higher order thinking skills. For this reason, there needs to be a revision in formulating the verb of the realm of knowledge appropriately, so that the characteristics of higher order thinking skills (HOTS) can be fulfilled, namely by having cognitive verbs level 4, 5 and 6. Krathwohl (2002) concludes that the original taxonomy consists of six categories, arranged in a cumulative hierarchical framework; the next achievement is a most complex skill or ability, requiring prior achievement.

According to Wahidmurni (2019), the insufficient verbal formulation is found in the lesson of Crafts and Entrepreneurship taught in high schools in Indonesia. In relation to this, King et al. (1997) explained that HOTS involved critical thinking, logic, metacognitive, as well as reflective and creative skills. These skills could only be acquired if students are given problems, uncertainty, questions and dilemmas. HOTS, therefore, is the main feature of entrepreneur candidates. Gaining knowledge through higher order of thinking is one method to internalise the values of entrepreneurship as it requires creative thinking and hard work. These capabilities are needed especially when one is to solve the problem with various alternatives.

The results of this study reveal that the knowledge formulation domain dominates the formulation of learning achievement in the syllabus/course outline instead of the behaviour and creativity domain. Therefore, to enhance the upcoming syllabus, the third domain of learning achievement should be covered equally according to the guidance given by The Directorate of Islamic Higher Education. This finding is supported by Welsh & Dragusin (2011) who concluded that there is no consensus about what and how the best way to teach entrepreneurship should be. However, it is generally accepted that the content and pedagogic should focus on three characters of entrepreneurs and innovators; knowledge, creativity and behaviour. It has been a consideration in creating the purpose of every lesson in a curriculum.

In terms of materials taught, all programs have completely formulated the theory of entrepreneurship and basic business that supports business planning. Generally, the materials support the Welsha et al. conclusion (2016) that students learning about entrepreneurship must gain broad knowledge about all functional areas of business, yet not focus too much on any. However, it is different from Zadeh et al. (2016) in that it identified the significant core of entrepreneurship competence to be developed and ranked, and these are having productive thought, motivation, interpersonal skills and leadership. These do not mention functional knowledge of business as a priority. This idea is in line with the recommendation given by the former Dean of School of Entrepreneurship and Management, Shanghai Tech which is to

combine the design of basic curriculum necessity to enhance the students' innovative talent by (1) offering experience-based lessons (2) exposing real problems, and (3) providing the space to think innovatively to solve business-related issues.

A similar finding is explained by Katz et al. (2016) from the comparative analysis of education entrepreneurship standard suggested by the Consortium for Entrepreneurship Education (CEE) in North America and the European Union Standards (EUS). It shows some differences, for example, what CEE considers as a topic, EUS did not. However, there are still some similarities in other general categories such as Entrepreneurial processes, Entrepreneurial traits/behaviours, broad readiness skills and knowledge of business functions.

Viewed from the aspect of the formulated learning method, all programs are already formulated in various learning methods. The learning methods are speech, discussion, question and answer, task and small project. These are found in Arasti's study in 2012. The research showed that some entrepreneur learning methods by the experts are: discussion, speech, group project, and simulation. The other learning methods need to be added on are: problem-solving, training in company and visiting. Business plan material, especially, showed that the suitable teaching method includes group project, case study, individual project, developing new entrepreneur projects and problem-solving. This shows that the curriculum is designed to focus on giving business experience and facilitate the participant to meet with the partner candidates through exhibitions, seminars, festivals etc. This indicated that learning entrepreneurship needs experience through field practice.

From the perspective of learning assessment, the program study formulates the assessment technique of cognitive study which is compatible with the assessment guidance from Ministry of Religious Affairs. However, attitude assessment technique is not formulated in the syllabus. The assessment special skill technique is formulated in full. Assessment in general skill technique is not formulated in syllabus. This supports the findings of Winarno et al. (2019) who stated that the instruments used by the teachers and lecturer to assess course competence or entrepreneurship lectures only measures the theoretical aspects according to what they taught, not for the basic competence as an entrepreneur.

Assessment focusing on a particular cognitive aspect is seen to be irrelevant to the terminal objectives of entrepreneurship education which aimed at building students' entrepreneurship character. The development of entrepreneurship character is relevant only if it is scored by using the behavioural scale and if it refers to the instrument developed to measure the dimension of entrepreneurship character indicator proposed by Saptono et al. (2018). It covers (1) reading, taking notes, and utilising business opportunity; (2) accepting business risk; (3) innovating; (4) being confident; (5) leadership skill; (6) future orientation, and; (7) orientation towards task and result.

The second part answers research question 2:

2. What are the levels of student satisfaction on entrepreneurship study programs?

The Evaluation of the Implementation of Entrepreneurship Learning

According to the students' point of view, the implementation of the learning process involves several aspects such as learning objectives, learning materials and learning methods, which describe their level of satisfaction with their learning performance that is presented in the following tables.

Table 6: The Distribution of the Level of Student Satisfaction towards Learning Objectives

Component	Percentage			
	IRHE 1	IRHE 2	IRHE 3	IRHE 4
Completeness of attitude, knowledge and skills aspects	79	81	86	71
Measurability of attitude, knowledge and skills aspects	76	77	74	69
Mean	77.50	79	80	70
Appreciation	High	High	High	Medium

Generally, most of the students are highly satisfied with their learning performance in terms of the learning objectives, except students at IRHE 4 that are classified at medium level. These findings indicate that the students are satisfied with the learning performance which is related to the learning objectives, especially in terms of completeness and measurability of learning outcomes covering attitudes, knowledge and skills aspects. Learning objectives seem to be elaborated well based on learning themes/sub-themes, appeared relevant to the indicators, and implemented well in learning process. In addition, the students argue that by learning entrepreneurship, they have gained knowledge, entrepreneurial character values and skills.

Table 7: The Distribution of the Level of Student Satisfaction on Learning Material

Component	Percentage			
	IRHE 1	IRHE 2	IRHE 3	IRHE 4
Completeness of material	85	83	86	77
Contextual material	85	77	84	79
Mean	85	80	85	78
Appreciation	High	High	High	High

The level of students' satisfaction towards the learning performance, especially in terms of the study material or material learned, is perceived as high or good. This finding indicates that the

material developed is in accordance with the learning objectives in the syllabus, the concepts are conveyed correctly, systematically (from easy to difficult, from concrete to abstract, from close to far), and correspondingly linked to the other relevant knowledge areas. The implication of this study reveals that the students perceive that the material being studied is very useful to provide entrepreneurial abilities.

Table 8: The Distribution of the Level of Student Satisfaction on Student Active Performance in the Learning Process

Component	Percentage			
	IRHE 1	IRHE 2	IRHE 3	IRHE 4
Students' active participation in learning	79	80	80	76
Cultivate students' positive habits	81	79	74	77
Mean	80	79.50	77	76.50
Appreciation	High	High	High	High

The overall student's satisfaction with learning performance in terms of the students' active participation in learning is considered high. It indicates that students perceive that entrepreneurship learning activities actively support them in engaging with entrepreneurship knowledge, attitudes and skills.

Regarding the teaching and learning material at the university, the lecturers confirm that the material studied includes entrepreneurship theory, management theory and business planning. Meanwhile, considering the practical material, the students are asked to create a business planning proposal. Additionally, the learning methods are almost the same as other subjects such as lectures, group discussions and assignments, which are added with other methods such as business field navigation, and organising exhibitions that are applied to a small number of study programs. This concern indicates that not all universities have applied a similar learning method. Widawati and Astuti (2012) show that college students' entrepreneurship interests could be increased by carrying out various activities such as career days, entrepreneur days, entrepreneurship seminars and student entrepreneurial elections. This condition still becomes the obstacle of state Islamic universities because almost all lecturers have stated that tertiary institutions have not optimally supported entrepreneurial growth on campus - there is no business unit/ incubator that can be used to facilitate student entrepreneurial practices or further development. If there are possibilities of pilot projects, funding support is still very limited.

In terms of learning strategies and methods, students employ a positive perception. In this case, the students perceive that the learning methods used have developed positive habits and they are actively involved in learning the knowledge, attitudes and skills that support entrepreneurial careers. However, most students expect additional learning methods such as hands-on practice, field trips and guest lectures. This is also supported by Madar & Hamid (2017) who explain

that there is a rising interest in entrepreneurship when the programs provided correspond with real life, because students gain direct experiences in entrepreneurship. Likewise, the results of the study by Wahidmurni et al. (2019) revealed that several tertiary institutions that succeeded in generating most of the start-up founders in Indonesia used applied business learning practice methods in the business team-based field.

Ahmada et al. (2018) conclude that there is no single teaching method to achieve the goals of entrepreneurship subject, but rather a combination of various teaching methods to provide various skills and the knowledge needed. Concerning this view, Harkema and Popescu (2015) propose an idea to include learning topics that are compiled from successful entrepreneurs and involve them in selecting business proposals for students. It is essential, because students need motivation from external parties, especially to see the success of the existing projects. The results of the study of Panfilova et al. (2019) concerning the implementation of entrepreneurship education based on learning models in real projects showed that student participation had increased professional skills. Meanwhile, the obstacles are still related to inadequate financial support, low company support and the difficulty in arranging schedules. This condition is also felt by most of the lecturers supporting the courses.

The Evaluation of an Entrepreneurship Learning Assessment

The evaluation of an entrepreneurship learning assessment from students' perspectives related to the knowledge, attitude and skill of entrepreneurship they obtain is provided in Table 9.

Table 9: The Distribution of the Level of the Student Satisfaction towards the Learning Outcomes

Component	Percentage			
	IRHE 1	IRHE 2	IRHE 3	IRHE 4
Provide knowledge for entrepreneurship	84	82	80	77
Provide entrepreneurial skills	80	79	80	76
Increase entrepreneurial intentions	82	80	76	79
Mean	82	80.33	78.67	77.33
Appreciation	High	High	High	High

The results of the analysis regarding the level of student satisfaction towards entrepreneurial learning outcomes are considered high in all study programs. This observation indicates that students feel satisfied and get benefit from entrepreneurial learning activities. The research findings support the report of the European Commission, DG Enterprise and Industry (2012) which describes that the aim of entrepreneurship education is to equip individuals with the knowledge, skills and attitudes that simultaneously shape the basic key to entrepreneurship so that they can meet their future needs. This finding strengthens the results of Nasr and



Boujelbene's study (2014) which show that formal teaching of entrepreneurship programs has a positive effect on student entrepreneurial intentions and profiles.

The high percentage of student satisfaction shows that although there are some weaknesses in terms of financial support and facilities for the development of entrepreneurship skills that are considered to be inadequate, entrepreneurial learning is proven to be able to foster student entrepreneurial intentions. This is inseparable from the involvement of lecturers because most of the lecturers supporting their courses are those who have experience in managing a business; some of them are running their businesses. This circumstance supports the findings of Aldianto et al. (2018) who depict the success of entrepreneurial learning, which is, if lecturers have been provided with entrepreneurial knowledge, or at least have work experience in the corporate and entrepreneurial sector, then they act as provocateurs and supporters who promote entrepreneurial mindsets.

Conclusion

The current study on planning, implementing and evaluating the learning process shows that the syllabus or course outline of entrepreneurship courses differs across universities and departments in Islamic higher education institutions. The implementation of this course has a positive response from students in which they are already satisfied with all activities in the course. Students even say that this course has enabled them to have good intentions to go on with entrepreneurship. The evaluation or assessment aspect focuses more on the cognitive sector rather than attitude and entrepreneurship skills. They, in general, highly satisfy the learning objectives that concern entrepreneurship attitudes, knowledge and skills and show excellent acquisition.

In regards to recommendations, the university and other interested parties need to academically and non-academically support entrepreneurship courses. In terms of academically for example, universities can offer competitive research on entrepreneurship, start career days, entrepreneur days, organise entrepreneurship seminars, or the election of entrepreneurial students. For non-academic support, the university can establish the entrepreneurship unit or business unit for supplementary elements of the course so that students can realise their business idea. The Ministry of Religious Affairs needs to conduct workshops by involving many related parties to create a good entrepreneurship curriculum so that the quality of the entrepreneurship course can be nationally mapped and standardised.

REFERENCES

- Ahmada, S. Z., Bakar, A. R. A., & Ahmad, N. (2018). An evaluation of teaching methods of entrepreneurship in hospitality and tourism programs. *The International Journal of Management Education*, 16, 14–25.
- Aldianto, L., Anggadwita, G., & Umbara, A. N. (2018). Mapping entrepreneurship education programmes: a case study of higher education institutions in Bandung, Indonesia. *Pertanika Journal of Social Sciences & Humanities*, 26 (T), 99-112.
- Arasti, Z., Falavarjani, M. K., & Imanipour, N. (2012). A Study of Teaching Methods in Entrepreneurship Education for Graduate Students. *Higher Education Studies*, 2 (1): 1-10.
- Carda, A. Z., Kageyama, K. & Akai, K. (2016). Effects of risk attitude, entrepreneurship education and self efficacy on entrepreneurial intention: a structure equation model approach to entrepreneurship. *International Review of Management and Business Research*, 5 (4): 1424-1433.
- European Commission, DG Enterprise and Industry. (2012) “*Effects and impact of entrepreneurship programmes in higher education*”. Brussels: Entrepreneurship Unit Directorate-General for Enterprise and Industry European Commission.
- Frimpong, A. O. (2014). “Impact of entrepreneurship education on partnership venture intentions.” *Journal of Behavioural Economics, Finance, Entrepreneurship, Accounting and Transport* 2 (3): 63–69.
- Ghadas, Z. A. A., Muslim, H., & Hamid, Z. (2014). “Legal eagle” entrepreneurship education for law students: special reference to International Islamic University Malaysia. *Pertanika Journals Social Sciences & Humanities*, 22(S), 83-98.
- Harkema, S., & Popescu, F. (2015). Entrepreneurship education for adults: a case-study. *International Conference “Education, Reflection, Development”, ERD. 2015, 3-4 July 2015, Cluj-Napoca, Romania. Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences* 209 (2015) 213-220.
- Katz, J. A., Hanke, R., Maidment, F., Weaver, K. M., & Alpi, S. (2016). Proposal for two model undergraduate curricula in entrepreneurship. *Int Entrep Manag J*, 12, 487–506. DOI 10.1007/s11365-014-0349-9.



- Kementerian Agama Republik Indonesia. (2018). *Panduan pengembangan kurikulum PTKI mengacu pada KKNi dan SN-Dikti*. Jakarta: Direktorat Pendidikan Tinggi Keagamaan Islam Direktorat Jenderal Pendidikan Islam.
- Khan, M. A. & Law, L. S. (2015). An integrative approach to curriculum development in higher education in the USA: A theoretical framework. *International Education Studies*, 8 (3), 66-76.
- King, F. J., Goodson, L. & Rohani, F. (1997). “Higher Order Thinking Skills: Definition, Teaching Strategies, Assessment.” https://informationtips.files.wordpress.com/2016/02/higher-order-thinking-skills_.pdf.
- Krathwohl, D. R. (2002). “A revision of bloom’s taxonomy: an overview, theory into practice.” *Theory into Practice*. https://doi.org/10.1207/s15430421tip4104_2.
- Lickona, T. (2001). “What is effective character education.” [https://athenaeum.edu/pdf/What is Effective Character Education.pdf](https://athenaeum.edu/pdf/What%20is%20Effective%20Character%20Education.pdf).
- Madar, A. R. & Hamid, A. R. (2017). Usability evaluation successful factors (SFs) framework through entrepreneurship program at community college Malaysia: modified nominal group technique approach. *Pertanika Journal of Social Sciences & Humanities*, 25 (S): 139 – 148.
- McClure, K. R. (2015). Exploring curricular transformation to promote innovation and entrepreneurship: an institutional case study. *Innov High Educ*, 40: 429–442.
- Nasr, K. B. & Boujelbene, Y. (2014). Assessing the impact of entrepreneurship education, 2nd World Conference On Business, Economics And Management - WCBEM2013. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences* 109, 712 – 715.
- Panfilova, E. E., Demkina, O. V., Galichkina, M. A., Istomina, A. I., Latysheva, V. V. & Teymurova, V. E. 2019. Learning models based on a real project in entrepreneurial education. *Journal of Entrepreneurship Education*, 22 (2), 1528-2651-22-2-324.
- Powell, R. R. (2006). Evaluation Research: An Overview (“Research Methods,” edited by Lynda M. Baker). *Library Trends*, 55 (1), 102–120. pp.
- Raposo, M. & do Paço, A. (2011). “Entrepreneurship education: relationship between education and entrepreneurial activity.” *Psicothema* 23 (3), 453–457.
- Saptono, A., Suparno & Najah, S. 2018. Development of an assessment instrument of affective domain for entrepreneurship in senior high school. *Journal of Entrepreneurship Education*, 21 (4), 1528-2651-21-4-238.



- Sulastrri., Wahab, Z., & Sununianti, V. V. (2017). “Relevansi materi dan metode dalam proses pembelajaran kewirausahaan pada tingkat pendidikan tinggi.” *Matrik: Jurnal Manajemen, Strategi Bisnis Dan Kewirausahaan* 11 (1): 26–39. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.24843/matrik:jmbk.2017.v11.i01.p03>.
- UNESCO. (2008). “Final Report: *Inter-regional seminar on promoting entrepreneurship education in secondary schools.*” Thailand: 11-15 February.
- Wahidmurni. (2019). Analisis indikator ketercapaian nilai-nilai kewirausahaan mata pelajaran prakarya dan kewirausahaan jenjang pendidikan menengah. *Jurnal Ekonomi Pendidikan dan Kewirausahaan*, 7(1), 55-68. DOI: 10.26740/jepk.v7n1.p55-68.
- Wahidmurni. Nur, A. M., Abdussakir., Mulyadi & Baharuddin. (2019). Curriculum development design of entrepreneurship education: A case study on Indonesian higher education producing most startup founder. *Journal of Entrepreneurship Education*, 22 (3), 1528-2651-22-3-374.
- Welsh, D. H. B. & Drăgușin, M. (2011). Entrepreneurship education in higher education institutions as a requirement in building excellence in business: The case of the University of North Carolina at Greensboro. *Forum Ware International Journal*, <http://forumware.wu-wien.ac.at/>, Special issue on International Society of Commodity Science and Technology, 1, 266-272.
- Welsha, D. H. B., Tullar, W. L., & Nemati, H. (2016). Entrepreneurship education: Process, method, or both? *Journal of Innovation & Knowledge*, 1, 125–132.
- Widawati, A. S., & Astuti, B. (2012). Faktor-faktor yang mempengaruhi niat mahasiswa untuk berwirausaha: aplikasi theory of planned behavior, *Sinergi*, 13(1), 92-100.
- Winarno, A., Rahayu, W. P., Wijijayanti, T., & Agustina, Y. (2019). The failure of entrepreneurship education of vocational high school students and college students: perspective of evaluation instrument of learning results. *Journal of Entrepreneurship Education*, 22(1), 1528-2651-22-1-268.
- Zadeh, M. R., Hogan, M., O’Reilly, Z., Cunningham, J. & Murphy, E. (2016). Core entrepreneurial competencies and their interdependencies: insights from a study of Irish and Iranian entrepreneurs, university students and academics. *Int Entrep Manag J*, (2017) 13:35–73. DOI 10.1007/s11365-016-0390-y.